



THE CITY OF KEY WEST

3140 Flagler Ave, Key West, FL 33040 (305) 809-3700

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

TO: Bob Vitas, City Manager
E. David Fernandez, Asst. City Manager - Operations

FROM: Staff

DATE: November 13, 2012

RE: Award of ITB 12-030: Replace Tarpon Pier to Ebsary Foundation
Company in the amount of \$1,421,523

ACTION STATEMENT:

This resolution will award ITB 12-030: Replace Tarpon Pier to Ebsary Foundation Company in the amount of \$1,421,523 and to waive minor addition errors in the Bid Tabulation sheet and the contractor's proposal.

BACKGROUND:

Tarpon Pier at City Marina Garrison Bight has 44 slips and is the largest of the live-aboard piers at the marina currently with 33 vessels. The concrete pier was constructed in 1972-1973. In 1990 the pier was extended an additional 93 feet and a wood deck added to the pier due to its deteriorating condition. The utility infrastructure attached to the side of the pier include electric, water, sewer, fire suppression and phone/cable service. The pier is considered in poor condition. A 20 foot section of the concrete deck fell into the water in 2010 and disabled all utility services.

Design/Permitting (\$179,942) of the replacement pier was awarded to Hans Wilson and Associate under a contract executed on September 9, 2011. Permits for construction of the new pier have been received from FDEP and USACE.

Invitation to Bid for the replacement of Tarpon Pier was released under ITB 12-030 on August 26, 2012 via demand star and the city's website. Bids were received on September 26, 2012 from seven firms. The basis of award of this ITB is the Base Bid plus Alternate Bid Item 1 plus Alternate Bid Item 2.

- Central Marine \$945,609.00
Ebsary Construction \$1,421,523.00
Shoreline Foundation \$1,505,890.31
Marine Contracting Group \$1,534,100.00
D. Higgins \$1,596,999.00
M & J Construction \$1,961,884.20
OTAK Group \$2,579,203.00

Key to the Caribbean - Average yearly temperature 77° F.

The lowest bid from Central Marine was deemed non-responsive by staff and should not be considered as the firm did not provide costs for several items in the bid. Additionally, the bidder contacted the City and acknowledged making series errors in their bid. The lowest responsible bid was Ebsary Foundation Company in the amount of \$1,421,523.

The following minor math errors should be noted:

- That Ebsary Foundation Company did not total the Base Bid, Alternate Bid Item 1 and Alternate Bid Item 2 on their bid sheet
- That the Bid Tabulation sheet should read \$1,421,523 vice \$1,421,533 for the bid received from Ebsary Foundation Company.

PURPOSE AND JUSTIFICATION

This project is a part of the City Marina life cycle management plan for city infrastructure as put forth in the 2011 City of Key West Action Plan and is justified due to the age and deteriorated condition of the pier.

The original design contemplated replacement of the fixed pier with a floating pier within the same foot print. After a public meeting held on November 2, 2011, the project was expanded to include 25 foot finger piers similar to what is found on Marlin Pier. This is identified as Alternate Bid item 1.

In order for the construction to occur, the existing vessels must be relocated primarily to Wahoo and Kingfish Piers. Since several of the vessels are extremely large an inspection of these piers was undertaken in order to confirm their structural condition and capacity. During the inspection it was determined that the corner bracing on the piers was failing and required replacement. The replacement of the 92 bracing angles is identified as Alternate Bid Item 2.

Use of Composite decking on the finger piers in the place of IPE wood was added as Alternate Bid Item 3.

OPTIONS:

1. The City Commission can award the Base Bid, Alternate Bid Item 1 (Finger Piers), Alternate Bid Item 2 (Bracing) and Alternate Bid Item 3 (Composite Decking) to Ebsary Foundation Company in the amount of \$1,429,143.
2. The City Commission can award the Base Bid, Alternate Bid Item 1 (Finger Piers) and Alternate Bid 2 (Bracing) to Ebsary Foundation Company in the amount of \$1,421,523. **(STAFF RECOMMENDATION)**
3. The City Commission can award the Base Bid to Ebsary Foundation Company in the amount of \$1,040,380.
4. The City Commission can elect to not award this project.

PROS AND CONS

Option 1 is the most expensive option with the composite decking. This option is not recommended. IPE is the preferred decking and in the case of the low bidder is actually less expensive than use of the composite decking.

Option 2 provides for the installation of finger piers and the bracing. Installation of the finger piers accomplishes several things:

- The dock is a more robust and stable docking system
- Allows for better securing of the large vessels especially during storms
- Improve the quality of the marina and continues to standardize the piers in the marina
- Makes the pier more user friendly to the live boards tenants
- Allows for removal of dock boxes, stairs, etc. from the main pier

Even though the repair of only a portion of the 92 bracing angles are required at this time in order to relocate the boats, it is recommended that all be replaced under this contract to prevent future failures. This option does exceed the budget for the project. Budget implications are described under financial impacts below.

Option 3 even though it puts the project within the budget is not recommended because of the advantages of installing finger piers as described above. Additionally, this would require internal staff to make the repairs to the critical bracing angles which is a time consuming and difficult process as some of the work is required under water.

Option 4 is not recommended because of the piers poor condition.

FINANCIAL IMPACTS:

The total budget for this project is \$1,400,000. Engineering and permitting costs were \$179,942 which leaves \$1,220,058 for construction. Staff is recommending awarding the Base Bid, Alternate Bid Item 1 (Finger Piers) and Alternate Bid 2 (Bracing) in the amount of \$1,421,523. This creates a budget shortfall of \$201,465. Staff recommends the following actions/budget adjustments in order to make up for the budget shortfall:

- Do not award contract landscaping (\$40,000)
- Do not purchase cale machines (\$18,000)
- Recently installed fish stations were less than expected (\$5,000)
- Delay electrical upgrades to Kingfisher and Wahoo until next budget year (\$100,000)
- Based on current schedule the new transient boaters restroom/dock master building will cover two budget cycles thus allowing usage of revenue from next budget year to complete project and existing budget dollars to complete Tarpon Pier (\$38,465)

These actions/budget adjustments total \$201,465. It is estimated, based on current projections, the net operating income for FY2013-2014 will total \$320,000 thus allowing for the completion of electrical upgrades to Kingfisher and Wahoo and construction of the transient boaters restroom/dock master building. This projection assumes no additional capital dollars will be needed for existing or unforeseen projects and that the 90-day operating reserve will not be utilized this year and can carry forward to next budget year.

The total project cost for replacement of Tarpon Pier is \$1,601,465. This correlates to a replacement cost of approximately \$36,400 per slip.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends that the City Commission select Option 2 and award the Base Bid, Alternate Bid Item 1 (Finger Piers) and Alternate Bid 2 (Bracing) to Ebsary Foundation Company in the amount of \$1,421,523.