

Cheri Smith

From: melisanderson <melisanderson@bellsouth.net>
Sent: Monday, April 4, 2022 4:33 PM
To: Cheri Smith; Teri Johnston; Jimmy Weekley; District I; Samuel Kaufman; District II; Billy Wardlow; District III; Gregory Davila; District IV; Mary Lou Hoover; District V; Clayton Lopez; District VI; Shawn D. Smith
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Key West hospitality = cruise ships!

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Key West Commissioners,

Please support cruise ships in Key West. We are all one human family, so there should not be a divide with Pier B. There is enough going on in this world; choosing to live in Key West where tourism thrives and our livelihood depends on it, encompasses cruise ships. The proposed agreement provides less than 1 ship per day, not 3 ships; this is better than what we had - this is what's best for our city and the future of Key West.

Please support the revised ordinance, so we can begin to see positivity in our little piece of paradise, Key West, and the positive changes to cruise ship docking -make the right decision!
Sincerely, Melissa Anderson

Cheri Smith

From: Matthew Helmerich <matthewhelmerich@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, April 4, 2022 4:29 PM
To: Jimmy Weekley; Cheri Smith
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Vote no to new Pier B agreement

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Jimmy,

You already know the facts. The voters of Key West -- by an enormous margin -- chose to have fewer, smaller cruise ships coming to our ports.

The new agreement put before you on Tuesday permits bigger ships, more disembarkations and gives away City property to absentee landlords.

City attorneys are taking us backwards, not forward. They're not interested in what voters want. The private Pier B operators are not interested in what voters want.

As a City Commissioner, you are responsible for upholding what Key West voters want. It's part of our City Charter.

[I urge you to reject the new Pier B proposal.](#) It violates every intention of the referendums put into our City Charter by Key West voters.

Respectfully,

Matthew Helmerich

Matthew Helmerich
Post Office Box 170
Key West, Florida 33041
mobile 305-923-9259

Cheri Smith

From: Matthew Harris <harrismatthew@icloud.com>
Sent: Monday, April 4, 2022 4:30 PM
To: Cheri Smith; Teri Johnston; Jimmy Weekley; District I; Samuel Kaufman; District II; Billy Wardlow; District III; Gregory Davila; District IV; Mary Lou Hoover; District V; Clayton Lopez; District VI; Shawn D. Smith
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Cruise Ships & Pier B

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Key West Commissioners,

Even-though Pier B did not have to make changes to their existing agreement with Key West they have worked with the City Commission, City Attorneys and Outside Attorneys to make meaningful and positive changes to cruise ship docking in Key West! Pier B has even gone as far as to provide funding to Mote Marine Laboratory for reef restoration projects. I ask that you support the Pier B agreement as I feel that it is what's best for the city of Key West.

Sincerely,

Matthew Harris

Cheri Smith

From: DJ McIndoe <djmcindoe@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, April 4, 2022 4:34 PM
To: Cheri Smith; Teri Johnston; Jimmy Weekley; District I; Samuel Kaufman; District II; Billy Wardlow; District III; Gregory Davila; District IV; Mary Lou Hoover; District V; Clayton Lopez; District VI; Shawn D. Smith
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Please support the Pier B Agreement

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

I hope you support both the ordinance and Pier B Settlement Agreement.
It limits the passengers to 3700 per day and gets millions of dollars to restore the Reef.

Deborah McIndoe
Key West Voter

Cheri Smith

From: Shannon Mihal <shannon_mihal@yahoo.com>
Sent: Monday, April 4, 2022 6:47 PM
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Tomorrow Meeting on Cruise Ships

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

To all Key west City Commissioners;

Please support the Pier B Agreement. This is what's best for our City now and for our children's future. I work in the service industry and depend on the cruise ship visitors. Please, do what's right for all residence.

Thank you for your service!

Kind regards,
Shannon McCarthy

Cheri Smith

From: David McCarthy <david_john_mccarthy@icloud.com>
Sent: Monday, April 4, 2022 6:28 PM
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Cruise Ships in Key West

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Key West Commissioners: I hope this email finds you all well. A little about myself, I am a registered voter in Key West and live on 17th Street in "New Town". The reason for my email to you tonight is that I would like to ask each one of you strongly consider allowing cruise ships at Pier B as per their existing contract or the newly negotiated one that Pier B didn't have to consider. I feel we have spent many of month's, weeks, days and hours on this subject. It's time to put this to rest and focus on not dividing the community any longer.

I totally support the revised Key West Ordinance and Pier B operational agreement and I hope you do/will as well.

Thank you for your long hours and attention to this important matter for our community.

David McCarthy

Cheri Smith

From: Jennifer Lopes <jenniferjlopes622@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, April 4, 2022 5:45 PM
To: Mary Lou Hoover
Cc: Cheri Smith
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Cruise Ship opinion

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Commissioner Hoover,

I'm emailing to share that I am not in support of the new proposed agreement with Pier B / The Walsh's.

My layman's interpretation is that we are giving them more and the city, the community, and the environment will suffer.

Thank you for finding the time a few weeks ago to meet at Key West Wildlife Center and supporting our Amended Concession Agreement.

Take care,
Jennifer

--

Jennifer J Lopes
305-304-2409

Cheri Smith

From: Eric Dehn <cadsrbest@yahoo.com>
Sent: Monday, April 4, 2022 5:26 PM
To: Cheri Smith
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Cruise Ships at Pier B

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

This email is to encourage the acceptance of "Item 21" on April 5, 2022, regarding the cruise ship docking at Pier B. One cruise ship per day, docked at Pier B, is a reasonable compromise for everyone.

Thank you,

Eric Dehn

Cadillac Style . . . America's Best !

Cheri Smith

From: daylin irishkevins.com <daylin@irishkevins.com>
Sent: Monday, April 4, 2022 5:04 PM
To: Cheri Smith; Jimmy Weekley; District I; Samuel Kaufman; District II; Billy Wardlow; District III; Gregory Davila; District IV; Mary Lou Hoover; District V; Clayton Lopez; District VI; Shawn D. Smith
Subject: [EXTERNAL] I support the ordinance

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

My name is Daylin Starks,

I have lived in Key West for 10 years now. I believe this ordinance is a more than fair resolution and I SUPPORT IT FULLY. I hope you all can show your support also and we can finally put this debate to an end. SCS has claimed that the cruise ships effect the reef, however have not provided any significant proof other than some statements from a 15-year-old report. In fact, there are more studies proving the exact opposite. I have managed Irish Kevin's for several years and I can tell you first hand that the cruise ship passengers do in fact spend money. I am offended and sickened to hear time and time again that "we do not need those kinds of people visiting", "they only go to the \$5 shops" (which is not true, and also what is so bad about that even if it was, those people are handworkers too, members of the community and have families to support also. I was raised that a CEO of a company was no better than a janitor, it is unfortunate to see not everyone was.). What started out as what seemed to be about the environment and Covid, quickly turned into in my opinion, discriminating people. From the "types" of people that come here to the very workers in our own community. I have heard people say "just get better at something else", " the bars down town are just the big bad guys, along with the employees" All of these things are frustrating to hear. We work very hard to ensure our employees make a comfortable living and as we do that, we also are able to make a profit that we pour back into the community by supporting several causes. On top of that, our employees are hardworking members of the community who matter. Over half of them do not even live in the voting area of Key West, therefore were not able to vote on something that is so detrimental to their lively hoods. These are folks that have worked here for a very long time and have families, have put down roots, and give back to the community as well. They have depended on the revenue from cruise ships over the years. We have mother's that were able to work during the daytime only and till make enough money that they could leave and be home in time to have dinner with their kids and tuck them in. Without cruise ships, they are not making as much money and have had to start working a few nights to supplement that, nights they spend away from their families when they were able to be with them before. When I hear people compare last year's business to a time when there were cruise ships, I cannot help but shake my head. Those should absolutely never be compared as last year was a one-of-a-kind year. No one could travel anywhere, Florida was one of the only places open, and people had stimulus money and other money saved up. I urge you to pass this resolution and do what is fair to everyone while keeping in mind that yes, the referendums may have passed, however not even 50% of eligible voters voted. Is that really a majority then? Please, do what is fair for everyone. Thank you.

Daylin Starks

General Manager/Event Coordinator
Irish Kevin's

211 C Duval St
Key West, FL 33040
734.564.3756

Cheri Smith

From: Haig Smith <haig@dangercharters.com>
Sent: Monday, April 4, 2022 4:56 PM
To: Cheri Smith; Teri Johnston; Jimmy Weekley; District I; Samuel Kaufman; District II; Billy Wardlow; District III; Gregory Davila; District IV; Mary Lou Hoover; District V; Clayton Lopez; District VI; Shawn D. Smith
Subject: [EXTERNAL] In support of cruise ships at Pier B

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

I am writing to voice my opinion on cruise ships coming into Key West. I believe that they should be able to come into the private dock, Pier B. I think balance is important. As a business owner are profits without cruise ships have been cut by more than 50%. That is huge. This money goes right back into Key West. The money we make here we spend here at the grocery store, restaurants around the island, and so on. So I support them coming into Key West at Pier B as they have been for the last few weeks. Thank you for taking the time to read.

Sincerely,
Haig Smith
305-304-9161

Cheri Smith

From: Sharon Smarsh <s.smarsh@outlook.com>
Sent: Tuesday, April 5, 2022 8:56 AM
To: Cheri Smith
Subject: [EXTERNAL] FW: Full Stop on Contract Negotiations with Pier B

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Hello,

Please make my letter part of the public record regarding the contract with Pier B.

Thank you

Sharon Smarsh

From: Sharon Smarsh
Sent: Friday, April 1, 2022 10:20 AM
To: jweekley@cityofkeywest-fl.gov; tjohnston@cityofkeywest-fl.gov
Subject: Full Stop on Contract Negotiations with Pier B

Dear Mayor Johnston & Commissioner Weekley,

It appears that the only path forward with Pier B is to put a Full Stop on contract negotiations. If, in fact, the current contract is not being adhered to, then that contract is null and void. The City of Key West is being played by better lawyers. They are probably holding their breath, hoping we don't uncover the actual facts and rushing us into updating the contract. Until we understand the use of the historic pier versus the modern pier, we cannot and should not move forward. It makes me wonder how our hard earned taxpayer money was spent with outside counsel. Unless these new facts are incorrect, they certainly did not perform their due diligence or earn their large fee.

Please represent our citizens and prevent us from repeating the mistakes of the past.

Sincerely,
Sharon Smarsh
1104 Angela Street

Cheri Smith

From: Sharon Smarsh <s.smarsh@outlook.com>
Sent: Tuesday, April 5, 2022 8:55 AM
To: Cheri Smith
Subject: [EXTERNAL] FW: Full Stop on Contract Negotiations with Pier B

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

This is a letter I sent to the mayor and my commissioner regarding the Pier B contract. Please make this part of the public record.

Thank you,
Sharon

From: Sharon Smarsh
Sent: Friday, April 1, 2022 10:20 AM
To: jweekley@cityofkeywest-fl.gov; tjohnston@cityofkeywest-fl.gov
Subject: Full Stop on Contract Negotiations with Pier B

Dear Mayor Johnston & Commissioner Weekley,

It appears that the only path forward with Pier B is to put a Full Stop on contract negotiations. If, in fact, the current contract is not being adhered to, then that contract is null and void. The City of Key West is being played by better lawyers. They are probably holding their breath, hoping we don't uncover the actual facts and rushing us into updating the contract. Until we understand the use of the historic pier versus the modern pier, we cannot and should not move forward. It makes me wonder how our hard earned taxpayer money was spent with outside counsel. Unless these new facts are incorrect, they certainly did not perform their due diligence or earn their large fee.

Please represent our citizens and prevent us from repeating the mistakes of the past.

Sincerely,
Sharon Smarsh
1104 Angela Street

Cheri Smith

From: Christopher Hamilton <chrishamilton170@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, April 5, 2022 8:54 AM
To: Teri Johnston; Samuel Kaufman; Jimmy Weekley; Billy Wardlow; Gregory Davila; Mary Lou Hoover; Clayton Lopez; Cheri Smith
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Item 21: Please Vote No on Pier B Agreement

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Honorable Mayor and Commissioners:

Thank you for last month's action to abide by the voters wishes regarding the public piers. Please vote NO on item 21, the Agreement with Pier B. 349 ships a year with an *average* of 3,700 passengers is way more capacity than called for in the compromise referenda. There also needs to be limits on the term of the agreement. One party shouldn't be allowed to keep the agreement going and going for eternity.

I urge you to rather look into nullifying the existing agreement, based on the information Safer, Cleaner Ships has found, so that any future agreement you do enter into with Pier B can meet the no more than 1,300 passengers a day and to provide an end to the term of the agreement so that in future every 10 years you can negotiate depending upon new realities.

Our water environment and our downtown's future depend on it.

Thank you for your consideration and your time.

Chris Hamilton
812 Fleming St, Key West, FL 33040



Chris Hamilton
812 Fleming Street #4, Key West, FL 33040
(305) 340-9942; chrishamilton170@gmail.com
Development Director, [Red Barn Theatre](#)
Friends of Car-Free Key West | [Facebook](#) | [Blog](#) | [Twitter](#)
KONK Life newspaper [Streets for People](#) column

Cheri Smith

From: Judith Murray <judithmurray22@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, April 5, 2022 8:58 AM
To: Teri Johnston
Cc: Cheri Smith
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Re: Withdraw the Cruise Ship OPERATING AND SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Mayor Johnston,

I am writing on behalf of the Key West community and myself that voted for smaller and fewer cruise ships to ask that the proposed operating and settlement agreement be withdrawn. I am shocked that after all of this time and discussion this is what the commission has come up with...nothing like what we have anticipated or can agree to.

I have lived in the lower Keys and Key West for 42 years. I am an active member of the community and to see the rug pulled from under our feet, with no respect for the residents and our vote. This agreement is appalling.

Please withdraw this agreement!

Sincerely,
Judith Murray

917-771-4778

<http://www.judithmurray.com>

[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Judith_Murray_\(artist\)](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Judith_Murray_(artist))

Cheri Smith

From: Judith Murray <judithmurray22@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, April 5, 2022 8:58 AM
To: Teri Johnston
Cc: Cheri Smith
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Re: Withdraw the Cruise Ship OPERATING AND SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Mayor Johnston,

I am writing on behalf of the Key West community and myself that voted for smaller and fewer cruise ships to ask that the proposed operating and settlement agreement be withdrawn. I am shocked that after all of this time and discussion this is what the commission has come up with...nothing like what we have anticipated or can agree to.

I have lived in the lower Keys and Key West for 42 years. I am an active member of the community and to see the rug pulled from under our feet, with no respect for the residents and our vote. This agreement is appalling.

Please withdraw this agreement!

Sincerely,
Judith Murray

917-771-4778

<http://www.judithmurray.com>

[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Judith_Murray_\(artist\)](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Judith_Murray_(artist))

Cheri Smith

From: Robert Maykut <rjmtsm@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, April 5, 2022 7:36 AM
To: Teri Johnston; Jimmy Weekley; Samuel Kaufman; Clayton Lopez; Mary Lou Hoover; Billy Wardlow; Gregory Davila; Shawn D. Smith; Cheri Smith
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Pier B Settlement Agreement

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Mayor and City Commissioners:

I voted “yes” in support of the referenda on Smaller, Cleaner, Safer Cruise Ships. I have also attended many of the commission meetings on this issue. I have also written to many of you regarding my full support of the initiative and working to ensure the will of the voters is fully implemented.

I am writing again to urge you to postpone a decision on the Operating and Settlement Agreement with Pier B. In addition, please require further analysis to clarify the current agreement and require that a settlement agreement does not undermine the will of the voters.

I commend you for reaching the compromise of discontinuing large cruise ships at City Piers and restricting larger ships to Pier B. With the information that has been published during the past week (including the Wheeler -Brookes Memo), it appears that there is more work to be done to fully understand the existing agreement and the type of agreement needed with Pier B.

Please hold the City Attorney and the outside council that was engaged accountable for getting to the bottom of the arrangement and for the developing an agreement that better represents the interests of Key West, the environment, and the citizens.

Please include this message to the Tuesday 4/5/22 meeting agenda.

Yours sincerely,

Robert Maykut
703 South St

Sent from my iPad

Cheri Smith

From: Ross Williams, DC <drrossw@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, April 5, 2022 7:35 AM
To: Mary Lou Hoover
Cc: Cheri Smith
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Pier B

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Commissioner Hoover,

I am writing to ask you to reject the new proposal for Pier B being brought before you tonight, for all the reasons outlined for you in Linda Wheeler's excellent legal memorandum on the issue. The voters have spoken clearly. Do not give up our rights to control our ports.

Thank you,

Sincerely,

Ross Williams

Attn: CheriCity Clerk Smith. Please attach this to the city commission's agenda.

Dr. Ross Williams
1217 White St
Key West, FL 33040

305-755-3409
drrossw@gmail.com

Cheri Smith

From: vmelendy@bellsouth.net
Sent: Tuesday, April 5, 2022 7:32 AM
To: Billy Wardlow; Clayton Lopez; Gregory Davila; Jimmy Weekley; Mary Lou Hoover; Samuel Kaufman
Cc: Cheri Smith
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Cruise Ships

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Cheri Smith, City Clerk, Please attach this email to the agenda

City Councilors,

It is unimaginable that we must discuss the rights of voters. I voted to limit cruise ship arrivals. I thought my vote would be heard and not laughed at as a joke. Every time I see cruise ships come onto Key West Harbour, I see the owners of Pier B are laughing at me. They are taunting me and letting me know that they are the ones that control our city and not the residents.

I feel very helpless these days that you can not or will not support the voters. It seems that I keep telling you, my councilors, to support the voters and limit the size of cruise ships coming into Key West. I would like to know what it will take for you to listen to me and the voters of Key West?

Please listen to the voters. Please do your job the voters hired to do. Please don't let the special interest groups sway your votes.

Thank you for listening to me,

Vince Melendy

109 Front Street
Unit # 213
Key West, FL 33040
305-296-1126

Cheri Smith

From: Nate Martin <natewchmartin@yahoo.com>
Sent: Tuesday, April 5, 2022 7:11 AM
To: Cheri Smith
Subject: [EXTERNAL] No cruise ships

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

No cruise ships and definitely not bigger ones please.

Nate

Sent from Yahoo Mail on Android

Cheri Smith

From: Jack Anderson <jandersonkw@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, April 5, 2022 6:05 AM
To: Teri Johnston; Jimmy Weekley; Samuel Kaufman; Mary Lou Hoover; Clayton Lopez; Billy Wardlow; Gregory Davila
Cc: Cheri Smith
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Opposing Resolution 22-2452

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Cheri -

Would you please add this email to the commissioners to the public record for the 4/5 meeting?

Thank you -

Jack Anderson

Dear Madam Mayor and Commissioners:

Although it seems superfluous to offer yet more opposition to Resolution 22-2452 while public sentiment is already running so lopsidedly against, it is impossible not to respond to the absurdity of the agreement as written. You must reject it out of hand.

Obviously, this is a vexing legal issue. The Pier B interests have attorneys who purport there is an iron-clad contract; their attitude is that but for their magnanimity in even deigning to sit with our insignificant negotiators, they could bring as many and as large ships as they wish. Yet, another law firm opines that the existing contract is deficient as written, and Pier B has no legal authorization for present day cruise operations at all. A reasonable person must logically assume the truth perhaps lies somewhere in the middle, not in the lies being promulgated by the self-interested.

One side wants us to believe that the poor, stupid, uninformed rabble was somehow duped into voting for that which they didn't understand, yet somehow did so by an almost two-thirds majority. One side claims that businesses and industry are being destroyed by a radical cabal, while local realtors, travel agents, and fishing guides – representatives of the actual lifeblood of the local economy – point to the explosion of tourism, despite (or more likely because of) the absence of large cruise ships. One side tries to suggest that this agreement will put people “back to work”, when there are more Help-Wanted signs around town than there are employees to fill the currently existing jobs. And most audacious of all is the Miami resident who laments the loss of tax revenues in Key West, while his Conch Trains continue running through – and over – this community as he pays his taxes in Miami-Dade.

At the end of the day, “truth” has – tragically – become lost in the eye of the beholder. What does still exist, however, is the result of a free and fair election, wherein the people of Key West voted not to have giant cruise ships pollute our community. Antidemocratic efforts from Tallahassee, big corporations, and a vocal minority notwithstanding, it is up to

the City Commission and its employees to implement the spirit of the result of that election. Endless negotiation with a belligerent oligarch didn't work for the Ukrainians, and there is no reason to believe it will work for the City of Key West.

Instead of quibbling over the arcane language of the contract as written; instead of coming to Pier B as the supplicant; instead of revealing ourselves to be feckless contract negotiators through continued appeasement, the City should simply pass an ordinance that denies use of its mooring bollards to ships that fall outside of the intent of the referenda. If a ship is too big to dock safely at Pier B, it can't come to Key West. Judging by the subtext of this travesty of an agreement, it also appears the City is in a position to dictate disembarkation fees. In what universe does it make sense to have a fee as laughably paltry as \$15 per head? Each disembarkation over the democratically stipulated limit of 1500 souls a day should be charged at \$1500 per head. The City may or may not be able to renegotiate the despicable contract with Pier B, but we should be able to pass ordinances which make these folks pay for the harm done to the community through that contract. Such "warning shots across the bow" might actually lead them to start negotiating in good faith for a change.

In any case, negotiate what is possible, legislate what is necessary, but please DO NOT pass the resolution to accept this insult of a contract as written.

Sincerely,

Jack Anderson

1109 Varela Street

KEY WEST, FL 33040

(917) 847-6005

Cheri Smith

From: L Sacco <saccografix@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, April 4, 2022 11:54 PM
To: Cheri Smith; Teri Johnston; Jimmy Weekley; District I; Samuel Kaufman; District II; Billy Wardlow; District III; Gregory Davila; District IV; Mary Lou Hoover; District V; Clayton Lopez; District VI; Shawn D. Smith
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Pass the Operating Settlement and Agreement, Pier B

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Writing today to encourage the passage of the settlement agreement during the meeting on Tuesday, April 5, 2022. Executing the proposed 'Operating and Settlement Agreement' with Pier B is in the best interests of the city, its residents, visitors and the surrounding environment.

Myself, my family and hundreds of other locals benefit from the commerce, tourism, visitors, and revenue brought into Monroe County through the cruise ship industry. Putting unwarranted restrictions on private businesses is unfair and un-American.

Hundreds of thousands of visitors return to Key West after having been introduced to the area when disembarking to our port of call via cruise ships.

Let tourism reign, let's get back to business, let the ships cruise back into Key West.

Thank you for considering the viewpoint of all citizens.

Sincerely,
Lisa Sacco
48 Bay Drive
KW FL 33040

Cheri Smith

From: Zachary Chappuies <zacharychappuies@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, April 4, 2022 10:50 PM
To: Cheri Smith; Teri Johnston; Jimmy Weekley; District I; Samuel Kaufman; District II; Billy Wardlow; District III; Gregory Davila
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Pier B

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

I am a captain in Key West and visit the reef multiple times every day. The affects that the cruise ships have on them is minimal to none. There is no noticeable difference of the reef pre to post Covid. I support the settlement agreement with pier B, it does cut down on the number of ships per day yet still helps stimulate our economy. Not to mention the millions of dollars that will be donated per dismemberment fees to help restore our reefs.

Cheri Smith

From: Alex Witzcak <alexwitzcak@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, April 4, 2022 10:42 PM
To: Cheri Smith; Teri Johnston; Jimmy Weekley; District I; Samuel Kaufman; District II; Billy Wardlow; District III; Gregory Davila; District IV; Mary Lou Hoover; District V; Clayton Lopez; District VI; Shawn D. Smith
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Cruise ships

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

We need cruise ships in this tourist economy in key west. We've always had them and will still need them. Please don't ban cruise ships

Cheri Smith

From: Monica Haskell <monicahaskell@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, April 4, 2022 10:07 PM
To: Billy Wardlow
Cc: Cheri Smith
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Safer cleaner ships

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Commissioner Wardlow,
This is not an easy issue. Please don't let us, the voters, down.

Look at the drawings with your own eyes.

Take this opportunity to get out of the existing contract with Pier B and come up with something new that better balances business and quality of life.

We're counting on you to do the right thing.

Best,
Monica

Cheri Smith

From: zane loveday <zaneloveday@bellsouth.net>
Sent: Monday, April 4, 2022 10:06 PM
To: Cheri Smith; Teri Johnston; Jimmy Weekley; District I; Samuel Kaufman; District II; Billy Wardlow; District III; Gregory Davila; District IV; Mary Lou Hoover; District V; Clayton Lopez; District VI; Shawn D. Smith
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Please consider allowing cruise ships!

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

I support the proposed Settlement Agreement with Pier B. It provides less than 1 ship per day, not 3 ships. It eliminates 10,000 to 12,000 people per day with concessions to 3,700 passengers per day. Also gets millions of dollars to restore the Reef. It's time to look at the facts and move on!

With cruise ships in town I am able to work more and provide a better life for my family. Please allow cruise ships!

Sent from my iPhone

Cheri Smith

From: Generic Name <jryanfrederick@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, April 4, 2022 8:54 PM
To: Cheri Smith; Teri Johnston; Jimmy Weekley; District I; Samuel Kaufman; District II; Billy Wardlow; District III; Gregory Davila; District IV; Mary Lou Hoover; District V; Clayton Lopez; District VI; Shawn D. Smith
Subject: [EXTERNAL] I support bringing cruise ships back

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

I support bringing cruise ships back. I work for Fury.

Thank you, Captain Ryan

Cheri Smith

From: Chris Jones <chris.jones230@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, April 4, 2022 8:45 PM
To: Cheri Smith; Teri Johnston; Jimmy Weekley; District I; Samuel Kaufman; District II; Billy Wardlow; District III; Gregory Davila; District IV; Mary Lou Hoover; District V; Clayton Lopez; District VI; Shawn D. Smith
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Cruise Ships at Pier B

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Good afternoon,

The city of Key West is in need of cruise ships to help support the economy. With extremely high rates for places to stay across the board, there needs to be another option for the average consumer to be able to come and enjoy our beautiful island. Cruise ships offer this option. Speaking from my experience with cruise ship passengers and other tourists there are many instances when a vacationer will come to Key West for the first time via the ship, fall in love, and come to return at a later date. I've seen this situation happen many of times in the last 8 years in the service industry. They really help sell our island to the masses. Having cruise ships in at full capacity will greatly benefit our island.

I really appreciate your time,

Christopher Jones

Cheri Smith

From: Elegantly Eclectic <shesacrafty1@yahoo.com>
Sent: Monday, April 4, 2022 7:09 PM
To: Teri Johnston
Cc: Cheri Smith
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Cruise ships

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Mayor, commissioners, and city staff,

Please stand with the voters of Key West, who unanimously voted to limit the size, type, and environmental history of ships. We understand how dangerous these massive ships are to the reef, how the only people who make money from the ships are the pilot's groups and lobbyists from outside of Key West. We came together as a community and decided to limit ships based on their size, track record with the environment, and how passengers impact the city. Recognize our votes. Recognize that we do not need cruise ships destroying our reef. Recognize that we as a community spoke, voted, and decided to limit cruise ships. If you will not recognize that, then what is the point of having an election?

Sincerely,

Jennifer Berube

Key West resident and voter.

Elegantly Eclectic
Because Coffee is worth celebrating!!

www.shesacrafty1.etsy.com

Sent from my iPhone

Cheri Smith

From: Bill Goldner <conchdoc@bellsouth.net>
Sent: Monday, April 4, 2022 6:46 PM
To: BILL GOLDNER
Cc: Cheri Smith
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Cruise Ships

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

PLEASE follow the will of the citizens regarding cruise ships.

PLEASE don't even give the appearance of supporting big business buying off our policy makers. DeSantis has made this clearly disgusting.

thanks for your consideration,

bill goldner
kw

Cheri Smith

From: dianeshelbykw@gmail.com
Sent: Tuesday, April 5, 2022 9:19 AM
To: Teri Johnston; Mary Lou Hoover
Cc: Cheri Smith
Subject: [EXTERNAL] please vote no on item 21

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Teri and Mary Lou,

I continue to support the limits on cruise ships that I and a majority of Key West citizens voted for.

I'm appalled by the City Attorney's failure to negotiate an agreement that reflects the wishes of the citizens and the instructions of the City Commission. Pier B's offerings in no way compensate for what they expect the City of Key West to give up.

In addition, It's inconceivable that a competent City Attorney either would be unaware of the issues documented in the Wheeler-Brookes memo or would not have brought them to your and the public's attention.

Given the cross claims that surround this issue, I'm of the mind that legitimacy of the current Pier B agreement should be settled in a court of law.

IN ANY CASE, the City Commission must not ratify, finally and forever, the proposed new agreement in PERPETUITY with Pier B Development.

Please vote no on item 21.

Sincerely,

Diane Shelby
1611 Von Phister Street
Key West

P.S. I have copied the City Clerk and request that she attach this correspondence to the commission agenda. Thank you.

Cheri Smith

From: Robert Yasuda <ryasuda4@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, April 5, 2022 9:37 AM
To: Teri Johnston; Cheri Smith
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Re: Withdraw the Cruise Ship ?OPERATING AND SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Mayor Johnston,

I have been a Keys resident for 42 years and remember well Key West before cruise ships invaded our town. It is absolute necessary to reduce their presence as the voters have demanded, and stop the process of ruining our town.

This has happened in other places and the results are terrible for residents to benefit only a few commercial interests who were created to take advantage of our terrible situation.

Please withdraw the agreement. Its passage will ruin Key West.

Sincerely,

Robert Yasuda

Robert Yasuda
ryasuda4@gmail.com
646.704.3445
www.robertyasuda.com
https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Robert_Yasuda

I

Cheri Smith

From: prudiec@aol.com
Sent: Tuesday, April 5, 2022 10:08 AM
To: Teri Johnston
Cc: arlo@safercleanerships.com; Cheri Smith
Subject: [EXTERNAL] The latest "compromise" regarding cruise ships

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Mayor Johnston,

I am completely disappointed in the proposal that is coming to the next City Commissioner's meeting and deeply disturbed by the apparent high jacking of what I - and I think - many others had hoped would emerge from the "mediation" process that I thought you and the Committee for Cleaner Safer ships had undertaken with the moneyed interests of the City and Pier B.

But here is a proposal which clearly violates the wishes of the Key West voters, gives Pier B MORE than the current contract, adds the bastardization of Mallory Square, and will forever change the appearance and the life of this precious island.

Because, make no mistake about it, this is only the beginning of the end of this community. Have you looked at the picture of one of the current mega cruise ships pictured at its own island?? The island is dwarfed by the cruise ship!! Even now, three ships a week only at Pier B make Duval Street a place not to go for anyone but the passengers on those ships.

We have the chance to make Key West a real island experience for many, but not for those who arrive and buy a tee shirt and a beer and leave. Yes, there is income from these behemoths for our well-known special interests, but there are expenses which make them not economically valuable to the City.

Safer Cleaner Ships has worked tirelessly and - unlike many others - honestly, to preserve the beauty and grace of this island. That group has been maligned in its efforts. How much more can Key West citizens do to persuade the community leadership to follow their wishes and not the money trail????

I will personally be deeply disappointed if you and the City Commissioners approve what is now being presented as a "solution." It is a give-away of all that we residents hold dear. I implore you and the Commissioners to reject this proposal and save our island.

Sincerely,

Prudence Churchill
10 Nassau Lane

Att: City Clerk Cheri Smith please attach this correspondence to the agenda

Cheri Smith

From: George Korn <foragerhouse@verizon.net>
Sent: Tuesday, April 5, 2022 10:19 AM
To: Cheri Smith
Cc: tjohnson@cityofkeywest-fl.gov; Jimmy Weekley; Samuel Kaufman; Billy Wardlow; Gregory Davila; Mary Lou Hoover; Clayton Lopez; Shawn D. Smith
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Say NO to big ships

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

City Clerk Cheri Smith, please attach these comments to the agenda of tonight's meeting with the City Commissioners.

To Key West City Commissioners:

At tonight's meeting which unfortunately I can not attend, I appeal to you to listen to the citizens of Key West who voted unanimously to downsize the cruise ships in Key West.

I have read the Wheeler-Brooks legal memorandum regarding this subject. I would hope that you have also read it. **It is obvious there are many legal matters that are being violated on this subject.**

And I ask:

- 1. Why is per B so desperate for a new agreement**
- 2. There should not be a new agreement with Pier B**
- 3. What will Key West gain for bigger and more ships at pier B?**

And I ask you:

Have you thought of the environment? Key West is all about environment especially when it comes to the water quality of the sea. This is just one, but maybe the main reason that people are drawn to visit Key West.

Our reef not only protects us but can not be replaced. Please read your conscience and vote no on letting Pier B allowing more and bigger ships into our fragile harbor. If you do not you have no concern for the future of "Paradise"

Thank you,
George Korn
3625 Sunrise Dr.
Key West FL. 33040

April 4,2022

Dear Mayor Johnston,

At this point, two years after the citizens of Key West overwhelmingly asked for change, the proposed agreement between Pier B and the city is ludicrous. That this is what you as elected officials have decided benefits your constituents could not be further from the truth. How can this deal reach a final decision just six days after it was presented? The agreement doesn't limit the size of ships, it lets the largest ships ever come to Key West. It allows for more docking days than ever before. The deal is "perpetual "? What business person would ever agree to that? How can you ignore the Wheeler-Brookes memo without at least thoroughly investigating its merits?

It is our opinion that a vote for this deal without further review is a total negation of your fiscal, ethical and legal obligation to the constituents you represent. Please reject this obligation to permanently change the character of our city.

Sincerely,

Judie L. Klitenick,LCSW

Michael P. Klitenick,M.D.

Cheri Smith

From: David McConnell <conant@ix.netcom.com>
Sent: Tuesday, April 5, 2022 11:23 AM
To: Billy Wardlow
Cc: Cheri Smith
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Cruise Ships

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Commissioner Wardlow

Restricting Cruise Ships in Key West is the only issue I'll be voting on for many cycles to come. That's how important I think handling this right will be to the city's future. Unfortunately my impatience has turned to frustration, to doubt, and now finally to cynical skepticism about just how this whole thing is being handled behind the scenes.

At the City Hall meeting tonight, please see to it that you and all the commissioners make your positions clear on the following two issues. 1) Do you continue to support City Attorney Shawn Smith? I'd like to see him out. He has stalled the entire process, has failed us in negotiations with Pier B, has overlooked imaginative avenues to solve the problem, and shows no intention of fulfilling the voters demands. Whether this is a result of bad faith or incompetence is irrelevant. 2) A clear statement of support for Safer, Cleaner Ships (which represents the majority of citizens of Key West) would be welcome and the easiest way to help voters decide who to back in the future. We don't need any cheap eye-rolling about us being unworldly idealists. Unfortunately, with the current ambiguity about who supports what, I'm left to oppose and work against ALL current commissioners, because ALL of them seem complicit in allowing this outrage to continue.

Let's please move forward.

David McConnell
702 Elizabeth Street
Key West FL 33040

Cheri Smith

From: RICHARD WELLS <celomtnboy@aol.com>
Sent: Tuesday, April 5, 2022 12:17 PM
To: Cheri Smith
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Fwd: Pier B Cruiseport agreement - please add to agenda April 5

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Forwarding again in case sent to wrong address. For agenda item 21 tonight.

Regards,

Richard Wells

Begin forwarded message:

From: Richard Wells <celomtnboy@aol.com>
Date: April 5, 2022 at 10:06:55 AM EDT
To: csmith@keywestcity.com
Subject: Pier B Cruiseport agreement - please add to agenda April 5
Reply-To: Richard Wells <celomtnboy@aol.com>

Mayor and Commissioners,

In a negotiation, both sides rarely get everything they want. Pier B wants to operate as they have for nearly 40 years, all the while paying the City tens of millions over this period to the benefit of our tax-paying citizens. SCS essentially wants no ships. This agreement, after closing both Navy Pier and Mallory Dock, allows for approximately 45% reduction in ship traffic. By any measurement, this agreement, successfully mediated in front of Judge Taylor, is a win for both sides.

By passing this the city will continue to receive its cut of the financial pie. The harbor walk will be completed by the opening of "Admiral's Cut", a dream of the City for many years. And let's not forget that the reef will receive direct benefit through support to Mote Marine for coral restoration. This is a big win. The historic use of Mallory as a ship berth has essentially ceased, SCS has succeeded to eliminate the small ships that they say they want. Ships that received confirmed reservations from the Port Authority, will have to be canceled. No more two or three ship days. A win for their side.

Let's put this painful process behind us and move on, calling it a win/win.

Sincerely,

Richard Wells
Ships' Agent
Port of Key West

Cheri Smith

From: John Kimble <chrisandkristine3@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, April 5, 2022 8:15 AM
To: Cheri Smith
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Re: Tuesday City Commission Meeting (Pier B Ongoing Litigation Comment)

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Mrs. Smith,

I didn't see my public comment documented on the Agenda for today's meeting in the public comment section. Was it received? Thank you!

Respectfully,
Chris Cavallacci

On Fri, Apr 1, 2022 at 11:10 PM John Kimble <chrisandkristine3@gmail.com> wrote:

Mayor, Commissioners and City Clerk,

Please attach my comments and correspondence to the agenda for the 05 APR City Commission meeting.

I apologize if any of these questions have been answered previously, but my professional duties have kept me from attending most of these meetings.

I will keep my comments to a bulletized format for clarity and brevity.

1. I believe it is a complete failure of our local government and elected officials if the following language in the proposed resolution is allowed to stand as it completely restricts our ability to seek redress in the future against harms caused by PBDC, and also restricts our ability to explore different economic opportunities at PIER B:

- a. This Agreement is entered into as a result of the aforementioned mediation and in furtherance of continued harmony between the Parties and to permanently, fully and finally resolve any and all present and potential differences or disputes regarding cruise ship operations by PBDC at its cruiseport and at the Port of Key West. The portion of this statement from "fully and finally" on needs to be removed. This completely limits the ability of the local government, by the will of the people, from disputing this issue going forward, especially if SB 1194 is challenged and edited in the future.*

2. Referencing the "Operating and Settlement Agreement" paragraph B: Economic and environmental conditions have significantly changed since the establishment of "The Agreement", as well as a significant expansion of cruise ship operations. It is the responsibility of our local government to conduct a full comparative review of the opportunities and costs associated of continuing the contract with PBDC for operations at PIER B. I believe that it is irresponsible to not explore alternative proposals for use and income generation, alternatives that respect the financial considerations of local businesses, the unique culture and remote beauty of Key West and the sanctity of our environmental resources. It should not be assumed that use of the PIER B by PBDC is in the "best interests" of the City. With that in mind, I have a question followed by a proposal: Does the original "Agreement" limit the city in any way from reviewing and discontinuing the lease of PIER B to PBDC presently or at any point in the future? If we are not limited from discontinuing PBDCs use of PIER B and ending "The Contract", then I would like to put forth the following proposals:

- a. Pause renegotiation of the contract with PBDC for use and operation of PIER B.
 - b. Establish a commission to analyze the financial benefit vs cost of continued operation of PIER B by PBDC, factoring in historical use factors to include revenue generated, subsidies, cost due to misuse/environmental impact, etc.

c. Explore alternative options of use for PIER B that benefit the local economy, local Key's culture and promote environmental responsibility to make our marine resources more resilient.

3. The fact that the State pre-emption is not being continuously challenged, calling upon the UNIQUE ecological circumstances of the Florida Keys, and leveraging our status as a National Marine Sanctuary, is a failure. Our local government should make every reasonable effort, respecting contract and state law and the economic interests of all parties, to challenge this pre-emption. I can partially agree with the pre-emption, and the importance of the State being able to regulate commerce. That being said, our unique environmental circumstance should exempt us from this. Even if PBDC retains an agreement with the city for use of PIER B, this pre-emption is a significant erosion of our rights.

4. SB 1194 is very clear in its language, preventing our local government and our residents from restricting essentially any part of seaport commerce. Section 311.25 was obviously written in response to our ballot referendum and details every way that we could limit or restrict cruise ship operations. That being said, I would like our City Commissioners and City Attorney to answer the following questions regarding subsection (1) of Section 311.25, which states the following:

a. *(1) With respect to any port that has received or is eligible to apply for or receive state funding under this chapter, a local ballot initiative or referendum may not restrict maritime commerce in such a port, including, but not limited to, restricting such commerce based on any of the following:*

b. Question #1: Has PIER B received state funding under this chapter? If so, was that funding requested and approved by our local government, or was it a request issued directly by PBDC?

c. Question #2: If state funding was not received, can we not renegotiate "The Agreement" and deny state funding for PIER B going forward, this enabling our local government to initiate restrictions?

5. Referencing section K.: *the donation of a portion of the per passenger disembarkation fee collected at Pier B to coral reef restoration or other Florida Keys environmental cause(s) designated by PBDC.*

a. Has the Mayor and City Commissioners consulted The Mote Marine Laboratory, The Florida Oceanographic Society, NOAA or similar organizations regarding the claims of ecological damage caused by cruise ship operation to our reefs, and cost of addressing that damage? Have any of these organizations provided a comparative environmental analysis of water quality, reef health, seagrass health, etc prior to the secession of cruise ship operations during COVID and during/after the secession prior to the resumption of operations? If so, what were the results, and has that data been made public for independent third party review?

b. If those studies have been done, and have shown that cruise ship operation is causing damage, are the funds generated by the donation of a portion of the disembarkation fee enough to cover the costs of reef restoration directly caused by cruise ship operation? Is this even a feasible proposal, or is it impossible to conduct restoration of the damaged marine environment caused by near constant cruise ship dockage and increase water turbidity? If possible, I would like Dr. and Crosby Dr. Patrick Rice (if in attendance) to provide their professional opinions on record for the meeting.

c. If, as multiple articles in our local newspapers and statements made at these meetings claim, that cruise ship operations are found to not be damaging to our local environment (coral, seagrass, etc), then what is the incentive behind PBDC donating a portion of disembarkation fees to cover the cost of reef restoration? I would like the PBDC representative to go on record with the answer to this question.

Thank you for considering my comments.

Very Respectfully,
Chris Cavallacci

160 Arica Lane Cudjoe Key



Virus-free. www.avast.com