



THE CITY OF KEY WEST

Post Office Box 1409 Key West, FL 33041-1409 (305) 809-3700

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Date: November 1, 2022

To: Patti McLauchlin, City Manager

From: Katie P. Halloran, Planning Director

Subject: Approval of the Selection Committee's Ranking of Submittals for RFQ #22-004, Duval Street Economic Corridor Resiliency & Revitalization Plan

Action Statement:

This resolution would approve the final scoring and ranking of the five (5) submittals received in response to City of Key West RFQ #22-004, Duval Street Economic Corridor Resiliency & Revitalization Plan. This resolution would also authorize the City Manager to execute, subject to the review of the City Attorney, a contract between the City of Key West and the top ranked vendor known as Jacobs Engineering Group, Inc.

Background:

The RFQ was designed to solicit proposals for key professional services including civil engineering for resiliency and drainage, historic preservation, landscape architecture, managing public participation efforts, economic development, financial planning, and multimodal planning for Duval Street revitalization. Scoring criteria in the RFQ prioritized vendors able to demonstrate expertise in the aforementioned areas, strong public participation methodology, overall methodology and client references. Scoring also incorporated depth of expertise in landscape architecture including specific expertise in South Florida and the Keys.

Required deliverables for this project include a master plan to best utilize the historic Duval Street public space to the benefit of the community and visitors alike. The plan will include conceptual designs for an entertaining, lively, and commercially successful public streetscape that will minimize vulnerabilities, particularly to sea level rise. This plan will be funded with Federal dollars from the Rebuild Florida Community Development Block Grant-Mitigation (CDBG-MIT) General Planning Support program administered through the Florida Department of Economic Opportunity.

The top ranked vendor for RFQ #22-004 is Jacobs Engineering Group, Inc., an interdisciplinary firm with offices in Miami, Florida. Jacobs' team is comprised of Sarah Marrs, ASLA, LEED (Project Manager and Urban Planner), Elaine Tolon (Deputy Project Manager and Engineer), Susy Torriente (Project Director), Sirpa Hall, PE, ENV SP (Principal in Charge) and Mitch Griffin (Lead Engineer). Jacobs exclusive partners include Brizaga (resource for public outreach), James Corner Field Operations (urban design and landscape architecture) and DDEC (resource for project brand management). The Selection Committee's average score for this vendor is 85.2 points.



THE CITY OF KEY WEST

Post Office Box 1409 Key West, FL 33041-1409 (305) 809-3700

The second ranked vendor is Stantec Consulting Services, Inc., also an interdisciplinary firm with a managing office in Coral Gables. Their team includes Ramon Castella, PE, ENV SP, LEED AP (Principal in Charge / Program Manager), Jared Beck, AICP (Planning / Project Manager – Phase I), and Sean Compel, PE, ENV SP, LEED AP (Design / Project Manager – Phase II) and numerous additional team members with relevant expertise. The Selection Committee's average score for this vendor is 83.4 points.

The Selection Committee met to score all five (5) eligible vendor submittals and their full score sheet is attached together with the complete submittal packages from all five vendors. The scoring for this project was notably very close amongst all five vendors.

Financial:

The City has not received an itemized cost sheet for professional services for this project, however, this resolution and vendor selection will authorize staff to negotiate a contract for the Duval Street Economic Corridor Resiliency & Revitalization Plan.

Strategic Plan (Key West Forward):

Implementation of this master plan will advance the most significant capital improvement project in the Key West Forward Strategic Plan.

Recommendation:

Staff recommends that the City Commission approve and accept the Selection Committee's ranking and selection of Jacobs Engineering Group, Inc. as the top ranked vendor for RFQ #22-004, Duval Street Economic Corridor Resiliency & Revitalization Plan. This resolution would further establish this team as the City's vendor to develop a master plan and construction drawings for revitalization of Duval Street. Approval of this resolution would also authorize the City Manager to execute a contract, subject to the review of the City Attorney, between the City of Key West and the vendor.

FIRM NAME: xxxxxxxx xxxxxxxx				
RFQ 22-004 Scoring Criteria Worksheet: Duval Economic Corridor Resiliency and Revitalization Plan				
		Score assigned		
	Range of possible scores per criterion			Comments/considerations
Strength of resiliency and drainage engineering services	0-20			
Acceptable	5-10		Engineering staff have some directly related experience and firm has completed limited corridor resiliency/drainage work	
Advantageous	11-15		Engineering staff have significant experience in related work. Firm has completed multiple similar projects that reflect scope of RFQ section B.1.	
Highly advantageous	16-20		completed extensive work on complex projects with scope similar RFQ section B.1. Firm has a significant track record of highly successful work demonstrating creative solutions to complex sea level rise challenges.	
Criterion score		0		
Depth of expertise in historic preservation	0-15			
Acceptable	5-10		Historic preservation staff have peripheral roles or limited experience with preservation policy as it relates to resiliency planning. Response includes limited examples of successfully completed similar projects.	
Advantageous	11 - 13		Historic preservation staff have notable experience with resiliency planning and are directly involved in project oversight. Firm has completed multiple similar projects.	
Highly advantageous	14 or 15		Historic preservation staff have extensive experience related to corridor and resiliency plans and are directly involved in project oversight. Firm has demonstrated oversight of multiple large scale or complex public spaces plans in historic districts.	
Criterion score		0		
Landscape architecture expertise	0-15			
Acceptable	5-10		Landscape architects have peripheral roles or limited experience in general or limited South Florida experience and response includes limited examples of successfully completed similar projects in South Florida and in general.	
Advantageous	11-13		Landscape architects have strong roles in project oversight, good experience generally and specifically in South Florida. Firm demonstrates considerable portfolio of successful projects in South Florida with notable creativity and capacity to retain City's unique character.	
Highly advantageous	14 or 15		Landscape architecture staff and project experiences surpasses aforementioned standards. Projects and staff lead the field with innovation and successful work in coastal South Florida.	
Criterion score		0		

Strength of multimodal planning services	0-15			
Acceptable	5-10		Transporation planners with experience in corridor planning and some familiarity of modal types typical of tourist economies. Limited examples of completed projects. Demonstration of capacity to develop a wayfinding strategy.	
Advantageous	11-13		Notably experienced transportation planners with specific modal experience directly relevant to Key West. Notable involvement in similar, successful corridor plans. Designers demonstrate notable success branding wayfinding strategies for main street districts.	
Highly advantageous	14 or 15		Transportation staff have extensive experience with modal experience directly related to Key West. Extensive work on corridor plans that significantly improved functionality of main streets. Surpasses aforementioned wayfinding/branding strength; an industry leader that clearly fits with Key West.	
Criterion score 0				
Public participation methodology and expertise	0-15			
Acceptable	5-10		Key staff have some experience managing complex public projects involving multiple stakeholders. Methodology reflects clear understand of deliverables outlined in RFQ section B.4.	
Advantageous	11-13		Key staff have significant experience overseeing corridor plans or very similar projects. Significant demonstration of successful similar public projects. Methodology is well designed and specific to anticipated challenges for Duval Street revitalization.	
Highly advantageous	14 or 15		Respondent surpasses aforementioned standards and provides details on multi-lingual, creative, inclusive public participation work on complex public projects.	
Criterion score 0				
Economic development and financial planning expertise	0-10			
Acceptable	5 or 6		Key staff demonstrate project experience and skills directly related to taks outlined in RFQ section B.5. and B.5.a.	
Advantageous	7 or 8		Staff capacity (experience) and past projects surpass expectations.	
Highly advantageous	9 or 10		Firms demonstrate aforementioned qualities and outline strategies closely suited for revitalization of Duval Street, specifically. Firm has deep experience managing commercial corridor redevelopment and funding full scale implementation.	
Criterion score 0				
Overall methodology and approach per RFQ scope	5			

Acceptable	3		Methodology and approach is clearly described and is responsive to each aspect of RFQ Sections B.1. through B.7.	
Advantageous	4		Response includes aforementioned components but is more tailored to Key West and Duval Street specifically.	
Highly advantageous	5		Response includes aforementioned components and demonstrates capacity to synthesize all components of the project. The methodology and approach are clearly developed by experienced staff utilizing best practices in all disciplines.	
Criterion score 0				
Client references	5			
Acceptable	3		References provided for assignments (projects) represent most professional services outlined in Section B. All references positive.	
Advantageous	4		References provided for assignments represent all professional services outlined in Section B. All references positive but some outstanding.	
Highly advantageous	5		References surpass aforementioned categories in that past clients consider consultants industry leaders or exceptional professionals in multiple disciplines associated with the RFQ.	
Criterion score 0				
Total firm score 0				

Duval Street Economic Corridor Resiliency & Revitalization Plan RFQ 22-004
Evaluation Proposal Ranking
Key West City Hall
October 4, 2022, 10 AM

Representative Group	Representatives Name
Engineering:	1 Albi Balliu
Multimodal Coordinator	2 Ryan Stachurski
Key West Distillery	3 Paul Menta
Chamber Director	4 Robert Goltz
Ocean Key	5 Johan Amneus

KH

POINTS ALLOWED		Evaluation Panel Scoring																								
		Jacobs					WGI					Stantec					RK & K					WSP				
		1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5
Strength of resiliency and drainage engineering services	20	16	16	16	18	16	15	16	18	14	14	16	16	17	13	16	18	11	15	14	14	13	15	16	14	13
Depth of expertise in historic preservation	15	14	10	13	12	13	11	11	14	12	12	13	14	15	14	11	13	12	13	13	10	12	14	14	14	13
Landscape architecture expertise	15	13	10	13	13	13	11	14	14	11	14	12	12	14	14	12	13	12	13	13	13	13	13	14	12	11
Strength of multimodal planning services	15	13	12	14	14	13	12	12	15	11	9	14	12	14	12	11	14	10	12	13	11	12	14	12	12	11
Public participation methodology and expertise	15	14	14	14	12	14	12	14	15	11	11	12	10	15	14	12	13	10	12	13	11	14	14	11	13	11
Economic development and financial planning expertise	10	9	9	8	8	9	7	7	9	7	8	8	7	8	10	7	8	7	7	8	7	7	6	8	8	7
Overall methodology and approach per RFQ scope	5	4	5	5	5	4	4	4	5	4	4	4	4	4	5	4	4	4	5	3	4	4	3	4	4	3
Client references	5	5	3	4	4	4	4	3	5	4	4	5	3	5	4	4	4	3	4	4	3	4	3	3	4	3

Total Points	100	88	79	87	86	86	76	81	95	74	76	84	78	92	86	77	87	69	81	81	73	79	82	82	81	72
Proposer Average Proposal Points		85.2					80.4					83.4					78.2					79.2				

NAME OF INDIVIDUAL