From: Ben Few <ben@benfew.com>
Sent: Thursday, August 2, 2018 4:45 PM
To: Todd C. Stoughton <tstoughton@cityofkeywest-fl.gov>
Cc: Mark Finigan <mfinigan@cityofkeywest-fl.gov>; Laura Estevez <lestevez@cityofkeywest-fl.gov>
Subject: RE: Consultant Review Request

Good afternoon all,

I've reviewed the proposals received for the City's property and casualty insurance program and would recommend renewing as is on all lines, with the exception of the statutory AD&D policy, which I would bind with Chubb, as the premium is approximately \$750 less. Overall premium is up, as has been expected due to the state of the global property market, but casualty premiums have decreased, which helps to offset the overall increase.

Speaking specifically to PRM's proposal, I believe it would be prudent to accept the two-year rate agreement with PRM on the liability and work comp coverage lines. This will lend itself to stability over a longer period and hedges against any unforeseen market changes. PRM has also noted that excess liability coverage is available, but given the City's self-insured status, combined with the statutory protections afforded by 768.28, F.S., I see no need to increase the current limits. PRM has noted that they would take over the ancillary coverage lines via broker-of-record letter, but I also see this as unnecessary if the City is satisfied with the current product and level of service it receives from PRIA.

With respect to PRIA's proposal for the ancillary coverage lines, I haven't seen a copy of the City's current AD&D policy through AIG, but the proposal seems to indicate that AIG limits are consecutive, where the statutory requirement differentiates between an accidental death and an unlawful and intentional death. For a policy that is designed to mirror the statute, I would bind with Chubb to save some premium dollars and would agree to the annually paid two-year term as the subsequent renewal is flat. Otherwise, the marine coverage lines look to be renewing as expiring. I noted that both the pollution liability and storage tank liability policies, through XL/Indian Harbor and Commerce and Industry, respectively, were previously renewed on multi-year terms and would imagine that is the reason why they have not been quoted this time.

I certainly appreciate the opportunity to work with the City of Key West, and invite you to reach out with any questions you may have.

Thank you, Ben

BEN FEW IV, CRM, AAI PRESIDENT 4560 VIA ROYALE, SUITE 3 FORT MYERS, FL 33919 P: (239)334-7727 F: (239)334-8166 ben@benfew.com || www.benfew.com risk managers BEN FEW & COMPANY, INC.

Risk Management and Insurance Consulting

This e-mail, and any attachment(s) thereto, is intended only for the use of the addressee(s) named herein and may contain legally privileged and/or confidential information. If you are not the intended recipient, any dissemination, distribution or copying of this e-mail, or any attachment(s) thereto, is strictly prohibited. If you have received this e-mail in error, please notify Ben Few & Company, Inc. via return e-mail or via telephone (239-334-7727) or fax (239-334-8166) and permanently delete the original and any printed or electronic copy of the e-mail and any attachment(s).

From: Todd C. Stoughton <<u>tstoughton@cityofkeywest-fl.gov</u>>
Sent: Thursday, July 19, 2018 9:05 AM
To: Ben Few <<u>ben@benfew.com</u>>
Cc: Mark Finigan <<u>mfinigan@cityofkeywest-fl.gov</u>>; Laura Estevez <<u>lestevez@cityofkeywest-fl.gov</u>>; Subject: Consultant Review Request

Ben,

Good morning. Yesterday we received proposals for both our Property & Casualty Insurance Program and our Ancillary Coverages. We sent direct solicitation requests to PGIT, FMIT, and PRM. We only received one reply from PRM for our Property/Casualty, and a reply from PRIA on our Ancillary Coverage.

Request you review the attached proposals and reply to the Finance Director with your review comments by August 3rd. Your comments will be used to assist the City in making the decision and will be part of our recommendation to the City Commission. Although there is only one submission for each area, we still have decisions to make and look forward to your review and input. If you need anything from me to assist, please let me know. Thank you very much.

Respectfully,

Todd

Todd Stoughton Risk Manager/Safety Officer City of Key West 1300 White Street Key West, FL 33040 (305) 809-3811 tstoughton@cityofkeywest-fl.gov

From: Todd C. Stoughton
Sent: Thursday, May 3, 2018 11:05 AM
To: 'Ben Few' <<u>ben@benfew.com</u>>; 'Sid Webber' <<u>sid.webber@interisk.net</u>>
Cc: Mark Finigan <<u>mfinigan@cityofkeywest-fl.gov</u>>; Laura Estevez <<u>lestevez@cityofkeywest-fl.gov</u>>;
Subject: Request for Consultant Letter to City of Key West

Ben/Sid,

Good morning. In the best interest of the City, we have decided to forego the RFP process for our Property and Casualty Insurance Program, and solicit the Pool/Trust directly for Policy Year 2018/2019.

In order to do this we request a formal letter from your company, specifically identifying your assessment as an independent insurance consultant with no ties to the pool/trust, at the request of the City. Some of the areas we request to be addressed in your letter are:

- Names of trust/pool the City has access to.
- Feasibility of access to traditional markets.
- Current insurance markets today, with any trends you are aware of.

The City believes that the use of a pooled insurance program is still the most advantageous route. Any additional information, and opinions are welcome.

Our anticipated process is:

- Receive consultant letters, review with legal.
- I will contact pool/trust (if that is the recommendation) directly, requesting solicitation.
- Finance Director will review solicitations and request your input on each individual solicitation for selection.

Thank you both very much.

Respectfully,

Todd

Todd Stoughton Risk Manager/Safety Officer City of Key West 1300 White Street Key West, FL 33040 (305) 809-3811 tstoughton@cityofkeywest-fl.gov

Renewal Proposal Analysis City of Key West				
Coverage Lines Public Risk Management	Expiring Premium	As Expiring	Proposed Options	
Property	\$460,748	\$566,406		
TIV - \$143,985,446	, .	TIV - \$150,584,133		
\$85,000,000 Wind Sublimit		\$100,000,000 Wind Sublimit		
5% Wind Deductible / \$25,000 AOP Deductible				
Crime	Included in Property	Included in Property		
Employee Dishonesty - \$1,000,000 Limit		_		
Forgery & Alteration - \$1,000,000 Limit Monies & Securities - \$1,000,000 Limit				
Funds Transfer Fraud - \$1,000,000 Limit				
Computer Fraud - \$1,000,000 Limit		-		
\$1,000 Deductible				
General Liability, incl. Law Enforcement, EMT Liability	\$274,009	\$246,891		
\$1,000,000 per Occurrence Limit				
\$100,000 SIR				
Auto Liability	Included in GL	Included in GL		
\$1,000,000 per Member Limit				
\$100,000 SIR				
	Included in GL	Leshadadin CI		
Public Officials Liability / EPLI \$1,000,000 per Claim	Included in GL	Included in GL		
\$3,000,000 Aggregate per Member				
\$100,000 SIR				
POL & EPLI subject to a per member combined aggregate of				
\$3,000,000				
Cyber Liability	Included in GL	Included in GL		
		Underwritten by Great		
\$1,000,000 per Member Limit		American		
\$5,000,000 per Pool Aggregate				
\$25,000 Deductible				
Workers' Compensation	\$261,067	\$235,230		
Payroll - \$33,392,560	\$201,007	Payroll - \$30,701,818		
\$3,000,000 Employer's Liability Limit		1 ayıon - \$50,701,810		
\$325,000 SIR				
Boiler & Machinery	\$9,880	\$11,152		
\$50,000,000 Limit per Accident		Underwritten by Travelers		
\$1,000 deductible on all objects except: \$10,000 deductible on				
transformers 10KVA and over		_		
Excess Liability Limits are available	¢10 7 01	¢21.104		
PRM Participation Credit PRM Total Premium	<u>-\$19,721</u> \$985,983	-\$21,194 \$1,038,485		
F KWI 10tai F feinium	\$905,905	\$1,030,405		
Public Risk Insurance Agency		++		
Hull & Mechanical	\$9,165	\$10,027		
11 Vessels - TIV \$887,050	. ,	Great American		
Deductibles:				
\$250 - 18' Mako Flats Boat				
\$1,000 - Carolina Skiffs				
\$5,000 - All others				
	A			
Vessel Pollution	\$3,620	\$4,061		
\$1,000,000 Oil Protection Act		Great American		
\$1,000,000 Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation &				
Liability Act No Deductible		+		
no Deductible				

Marina Operator's Legal Liability	\$22,472	\$24,016	
\$1,000,000 Limit		Great American	
Protection and Indemnity Included			
\$1,000,000 Limited Pollution Extension Sublimit			
\$1,000,000 Marina Operator's Pollution Liability Sublimit			
Land Storage Included			
\$2,500 Deductible			
\$5,945,000 Receipts			
Wharfinger's Liability	\$16,066	\$17,575	
\$2,000,000 Limit		Great American	
\$10,000 Deductible			
\$4,229,800 Receipts			
Outer Mole Excess Liability	\$8,684	\$9,500	
\$4,000,000 Excess of \$1,000,000	,	Great American	
Accidental Death & Dismemberment - AIG	\$5,558	\$6,768	\$6,019
Statutory Limits	++,+++	1-Year Term, Annual	1-Year Term, Annual
		\$6,430	\$6,019
		2-Year Term, Annual	2-Year Term, Annual
		\$12,860	\$11,405
		2-Year Term, Prepay	2-Year Term, Prepay
PRIA Total Premium	\$65,565	\$71,947	\$71,198
Grand Total Renewal Premium	\$1,051,548	\$1,110,432	\$1,109,683