



March 5, 2015

Ms. Karen Olson, Deputy Director  
Port and Marine Services  
Via E-mail: [kolson@cityofkeywest-fl.gov](mailto:kolson@cityofkeywest-fl.gov)

**RE: 907 Caroline Street**

Dear Karen,

Thank you for asking us to work with you on the redevelopment of 907 Caroline.

In accordance with your request, I have evaluated the property for purposes of providing this proposal. Based on our onsite meeting with Dough Bradshaw, it appears that the City does not have a fixed program. Therefore, this proposal is being written as an analysis with options.

The existing site consists of a one story CBS building fronting Caroline Street to the south, parking to the north, the new West Marine building to the east and "Flagler Station" to the west.

The site is a portion of the City owned Key West Bight. For zoning compliance calculations, the entire parcel is generally considered, or more accurately, that has been the case in the past.

The existing building shell is 30' x 60' with a 10.5 foot wide porch that wraps around two sides. The total building area is 1800 square feet plus 1,055 square feet of open air porches, for an overall gross floor area of 2,855 square feet with an overall foot print of 40.5' x 70.5' long. The survey shows the building as being 4 feet off the east West Marine side property line. The finish floor elevation is 3.57 MSL. The following zoning regulations apply.

Zoning HRCC-2

Impervious surface ratio	60%
Maximum building coverage	50%
Front setback	10'
Street side setback	7.5'
Side setback	5'
Rear setback	15'
Maximum height	35'
Maximum F.A.R.	0.5
Maximum density	8 units/acre

FEMA Flood Zone AE9  
Existing finish floor elevation is 3.57' M.S.L.

The calculations for our development parcel will be based on the entire parcel, so a current survey will be required. I did a quick analysis based on an aerial photo and it appears that this property exceeds impervious surface ratio requirements and does not meet the minimum landscape requirements. Therefore, I recommend limiting the replacement building to the existing footprint area of 2,855 square feet. This approach will allow maximum development without the need for an impervious surface ratio variance.

410 Angela Street  
Key West, Florida 33040  
Telephone (305) 296-1347  
Facsimile (305) 296-2727  
Florida License AAC002022  
[www.BenderArchitects.com](http://www.BenderArchitects.com)

The following uses are allowed in the HRCC-2 District, either as of right or conditional. Permitted uses include the following:

- (1) Single-family and two-family residential dwellings.
- (2) Multiple-family residential dwellings.
- (3) Group homes with less than or equal to six residents as provided in section 122-1246.
- (4) Places of worship.
- (5) Business and professional offices.
- (6) Commercial retail low and medium intensity less than or equal to 5,000 square feet as provided in division 11 of article V of this chapter.
- (7) Medical services.
- (8) Parking lots and facilities.
- (9) Restaurants, excluding drive-through.
- (10) Veterinary medical services without outside kennels.

**Sec. 122-718. Conditional uses.**

Conditional uses in the HRCC-2 Key West Bight district are as follows:

- (1) Group homes with seven to 14 residents as provided in section 122-1246.
- (2) Community centers, clubs, and lodges.
- (3) Cultural and civic activities.
- (4) Educational institutions and day care.
- (5) Nursing homes, rest homes and convalescent homes.
- (6) Parks and recreation, active and passive.
- (7) Protective services.
- (8) Public and private utilities.
- (9) Bars and lounges.
- (10) Boat sales and service.

- (11) Commercial retail low and medium intensity greater than 5,000 square feet as provided in division 11 of article V of this chapter.
- (12) Commercial retail high intensity as provided in division 11 of article V of this chapter.
- (13) Funeral homes.
- (14) Light industrial.
- (15) Marinas.
- (16) Small recreational power-driven equipment rentals.

Your current maintenance facility is not specifically listed, although it currently exists in the building and supports your activities at the Key West Bight. In my opinion, this makes it an incidental use that is permissible. Alternately, it can be classified as commercial retail low to medium intensity of less than 5,000 s.f. which is a permitted use, and in my opinion the correct category, or as light industrial which is a conditional use. In any event, this question is best answered by the Planning Department. I suggest that Kevin Bond be consulted.

#### **OPTIONS FOR DEVELOPMENT**

In order to maximize the use of this site, I suggest a multi-story mixed use building. The first floor is best suited for commercial uses such as retail, restaurants, or offices. The second floor could accommodate apartment uses or office space. If office space is provided, then the need for vertical accessibility will need to be addressed.

This proposal is not intended to be a complete feasibility study or detail options for highest and best use. However, in my unstudied opinion, I recommend that consideration be given to a mixed use building with commercial on the first floor and affordable work force housing on the upper floor(s). There is adequate space for 3 or 4 units.

#### **CONSTRUCTION COST BUDGETS CONSIDERATIONS**

Construction costs can vary substantially based on construction types, amenities and finishes. New construction in Key West is currently averaging \$400/square foot, which will be used for this analysis.

A building footprint of 40 x 70 feet will be assumed for 2,800 square feet. The final program will determine how much space will be allocated to retail and how much to the City maintenance shop, but this analysis assumes that costs are the same. The upper level apartments will be assumed to have lofts and a 6 foot wide exterior balcony access. This will provide area breakdowns as follows.

Balcony: 6 feet wide x 70 feet long	420 s.f.
Apartment main floor: 34' x 70'	2,380 s.f.
<u>Lofts @ 50%</u>	<u>1,200 s.f.</u>
Totals	4,000 s.f.

The possible apartment configurations are:

One floor only: 2,400 s.f.

Four @ 600 s.f. each (or)

Three @ 800 s.f. each.

Adding the loft will increase these to four (4) at 900 s.f. each or three (3) @ 1,200 each. Of course, a cost benefit analysis will be necessary to determine if additional space will yield sufficient income to offset the additional construction cost. For this exercise, I have assumed the apartments will be would be one level at 2,400 s.f. total conditioned space with 400 s.f. of exterior balcony access. A construction budget can be established as follows.

Commercial space: 2,800 s.f. @ \$400.....	\$1,120,000
Apartments conditioned: 2,400 s.f. @ \$400.....	960,000
Apartment balcony: 400 s.f. @ \$250.....	100,000
Subtotal general construction.....	\$2,180,000
Demolition and site preparation @ 4%.....	87,200
Site work @ 6%.....	130,800
Total probable construction.....	\$2,398,000

Additional costs will include architectural/engineering fees, contingencies and reimbursable expenses. Using a \$2.4 million dollar construction cost, the State of Florida's, Department of Management Services Fee Guide Calculator projects architectural/engineering fees to be 6.67% of construction cost, or \$160,000 plus reimbursable expenses for travel, printing, soils reports, and surveys. Since this project is not yet funded, I recommend a 10% contingency to account for inflation and unknowns. A budget calculation follows:

General construction.....	\$2,400,000
A/E Fees.....	160,000
Soils report.....	10,000
Reimbursable expenses.....	10,000
Subtotal.....	\$2,580,000
Contingency @ 10%.....	258,000
Total recommended budget.....	\$2,838,000

Of course numerous possibilities exist, including elimination of the residential units. However, Key West has an affordable workforce housing problem, and this is an opportunity to provide a model for others to follow.

## RECOMMENDATIONS

This analysis has raised a number of issues. In my opinion, further study is required in order to establish a program. I suggest that you conduct an assessment of alternatives, including a cost benefit analysis. This could be done in house through your Planning Department if there is time available from the staff's regular duties. Bender & Associates also provides analysis services as needed.

I propose to provide a feasibility analysis to determine the highest and best use, with fees estimated as follows.

<b>Task Description</b>	<b>Project Manager</b>	<b>Staff Architect</b>	<b>Intern Architect</b>	<b>Admin. Assistant</b>
Gather data & documents (including current lease information)	3			5
Research alternatives, documents, Codes, meet with City Staff & establish site boundaries	20			
Schematic analysis of design options	8	10	10	
Research comparable project costs: estimate option costs	8			
Write draft report	8			5
Meetings with City staff to review draft findings	3			
Final draft report and schematic option development	5	5	5	5
<b>Total Hours</b>	55	15	15	15
\$/hour	\$180	\$140	\$100	\$80
Labor cost	\$9,900	\$2,100	\$1,500	\$1,200
Total B&A Labor Cost	\$14,700			

The deliverable will be a report of findings along with a schematic site plan and schematic floor plan options as appropriate. Each design option will be based on use options. The report will include a cost benefit and social benefit analysis as it relates to meeting comp plan goals.

Please call to discuss as appropriate.

Sincerely,



Bert L. Bender, Architect

BLB/ddk

Cc: Doug Bradshaw

Attachment

# Fee Guide Calculator

## For Architectural and Engineering Services

State of Florida, Department of Management Services



Version Posted: March 2012

Project Name: **907 Caroline Street, Key West, Florida**

CONSTRUCTION COST FOR BUILDING (Sitework Not Included)	COMPLEXITY GROUP - PERCENTAGE						
	A	B	C	D	E	F	G
\$ 2,400,000	8.61%	7.96%	8.39%	7.31%	<b>6.67%</b>	6.04%	8.25%
<b>CALCULATED FEE</b>	<b>\$206,646</b>	<b>\$191,019</b>	<b>\$201,353</b>	<b>\$175,503</b>	<b>\$160,180</b>	<b>\$144,948</b>	<b>\$197,886</b>

**Instructions: Fill in probable construction cost at left and push enter key.**

**GROUP DEFINITIONS:**

- "A" - **CONSIDERABLY MORE THAN AVERAGE COMPLEXITY:** Complex Laboratories, Medical Hospitals
- "B" - **MORE THAN AVERAGE COMPLEXITY:** Average Laboratories, Mental Hospitals, Simple Medical Hospitals, Clinics, Court Houses, Theatres, Complex University Buildings, Special Purpose Classrooms, Laboratory Classrooms, Libraries, Auditoriums, Museums, Air Terminals, Food Service Facilities, Specialized Detention Areas, Detention-Treatment Areas, Residences, Emergency Management Centers
- "C" - **REPAIRS AND RENOVATIONS:** Miscellaneous Repairs and Renovations, Alterations to Office Space or Dormitory Space, Fire Code Corrective Work
- "D" - **AVERAGE COMPLEXITY:** General Office Space, General Teaching Space, Gymnasiums, General Detention Living Facilities, Factory Buildings
- "E" - **LESS THAN AVERAGE COMPLEXITY:** Apartment Buildings, Dormitory Buildings, Service Garages, Stadiums, Repetitive Design Facilities, Office Buildings With Undefined Interior Space (open for later partitioning), Specialized Parking Structures
- "F" - **CONSIDERABLY LESS THAN AVERAGE COMPLEXITY:** Warehouses, Parking Garages, Storage Facilities
- "G" - **BUILDING ENGINEERING SERVICES:** Mechanical, Electrical and Structural not exceeding \$1,000,000 in construction (Not including Site Civil)

**ADDITIONAL SERVICES & EXPENSES:**

**The following services are considered Additional to Basic Services and are not included within the basic fee represented by the fee guides:**

- |  |   |
|--|---|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>-Feasibility Studies/ Analysis</li> <li>-Facility Programming</li> <li>-Master Planning</li> <li>-Soils Investigations/Reports</li> <li>-Surveys -Topographic/Boundary Vegetation/Improvements/Utilities</li> <li>-Measured Drawings of Existing Facilities</li> <li>-Existing Facilities Analysis</li> <li>-Toxic Substance Mitigation Surveys and Consultation</li> <li>-Site Environmental Assessments</li> <li>-Site DRI, PUD, Site Plan Review and/or Zoning Modifications</li> <li>-Traffic Analysis and Traffic Signal Warrant Studies</li> <li>-Civil Engineering Design including Paving/Grading/Utilities /Drainage/Stormwater Management/Environmental &amp; All Site Permitting</li> <li>-Existing Site Utility Infrastructure Improvements</li> <li>-Site Lighting Design</li> <li>-Landscape Architectural &amp; Irrigation Design</li> <li>-Specialty Consultants                     <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Voice/Data Communications; Electronic/Audio Visual; Food Service Equipment; Hazardous Material; Hospital/Laboratory; Interior Design; Indoor Air Quality; Quality Control; Theater/Acoustical; Security</li> </ul> </li> <li>-Life Cycle Cost (ROI) and/or Federal DOE Energy Analysis</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>-LEED Consultation</li> <li>-Graphic and Signage Design</li> <li>-Special Code Reviews including ACHA</li> <li>-Detailed Cost Estimates</li> <li>-Documents Prepared For:                     <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>-Alternate Bids Exceeding Contract Scope</li> <li>-Excessive Change Orders</li> <li>-Multiple Construction Contracts</li> <li>-Record Documents/As Built</li> </ul> </li> <li>-Prolonged Construction Contract Administration Services</li> <li>-Structural Threshold Inspections</li> <li>-Project Representation During Construction Beyond Bi-Monthly Administration</li> <li>-Additional Construction Contract Administration Services for Multiple Contracts</li> <li>-Building Commissioning and Training Services</li> <li>-Post Occupancy Inspections/ Evaluations</li> <li>-Renderings/ Models</li> <li>- Substantive Changes to Scope, Size or Complexity</li> <li>-Owner Requested Changes to Approved Documents</li> <li>-Reimbursable Expenses*                     <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Including, but not limited to, reproduction/ printing costs, travel expenses and special mail service expenses</li> </ul> </li> </ul> |
|--|---|