# Historic Architectural Review Commission Staff Report for Item 18 

To: $\quad \begin{aligned} & \text { Chairman Bryan Green and Historic Architectural Review Commission } \\ & \text { Members }\end{aligned}$

From: Kathleen McDonald, MHP Historic Preservation Planner II

Meeting Date: $\quad$ May 25, 2021
Applicant: Titan Contracting
Address: \#905 Emma Street

## Description of Work:

Demolition of roof overhangs.

## Site Facts:

The concrete block structure under review is an accessory to the main structure at 905 Emma Street. The accessory structure is not present on any of the Sanborn maps or historic photos. Staff has determined the accessory structure to be non-historic and non-contributing to the district.

## Ordinances Cited on Review:

- Section 102-217 (3), demolition for non-historic or non-contributing structures of the Land Development Regulations.
- Section 102-218 (b), Criteria for demolitions.


## Staff Analysis:

The Certificate of Appropriateness under review proposes the demolition of the roof overhangs on the non-historic, non-contributing concrete block accessory structure at 905 Emma Street. This application proposes to put a gable roof structure on top of the existing flat roof.

It is staff's opinion that the request for the demolition of the existing roof overhangs shall be based on the demolition criteria of Chapter 102 Section 218(b) of the LDR's. The criteria state the following;
b) The historic architectural review commission shall not issue a certificate of appropriateness that would result in:
(1) Removing buildings or structures that are important in defining the overall historic character of a district or neighborhood so that the character is diminished;

It is staff's opinion that the removal of the existing roof overhangs will not have a negative effect on the character of the surrounding neighborhood.
(2) Removing historic buildings or structures and thus destroying the historic relationship between buildings or structures and open space;

The roof overhangs under review for demolition are not historic.
(3) Removing an historic building or structure in a complex; or removing a building façade; or removing a significant later addition that is important in defining the historic character of a site or the surrounding district or neighborhood;

The roof overhangs under review are not significant later additions, and they have not acquired historic significance that is important to the site or surrounding district.
(4) Removing buildings or structures that would otherwise qualify as contributing, as set forth in section 102-62(3).

It is staff's opinion that the roof overhangs in question will not qualify as contributing elements to the site or to the historic district in the near future.

It is staff's opinion that the Commission can review the request for demolition. If approved, this will be the only required reading for demolition.

HARC MAJOR PROJECTS CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
\$420 NON-REFUNDABLE BASE APPLICATION FEE - OTHER FEES MAY BE APPLICABLE Rev 12/14/2020 ET


1300 White Street Key West, Florida 33040

| HARC COA \# | REVISION \# | INITIAL \& DATE |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| FLOOD ZONE | ZONING DISTRICT | BLDG PERMIT\# |

A PRE-APPLICATION MEETING WITH HARC STAFF IS REQUIRED PRIOR TO SUBMITTAL
ADDRESS OF PROPOSED PROJECT: name on deed:

OWNER'S MAILING ADDRESS:

APPLICANT NAME:
APPLICANT'S ADDRESS:

APPLICANT'S SIGNATURE:


ANY PERSON THAT MAKES CHANGES TO AN APPROVED CERTIFICATE OFAPPROPRIATENESS MUST SUBMIT A NEW APPLICATION.
FLORIDA STATUTE 837.06: WHOEVER KNOWINGLY MAKES A FALSE STATEMENT IN WRITING AND WITH THE INTENT TO MISLEAD A PUBLIC SERVANT IN THE PERFORMANCE OF HIS OR HER OFFICIAL DUTY SHALL BE GUILTY OF A MISDEMEANOR OF THE SECOND-DEGREE PUNISHABLE PER SECTION 775.082 OR 775.083 . THE APPLICANT FURTHER HEREBY ACKNOWLEDGES THAT THE SCOPE OF WORK AS DESCRIBED IN THE APPLICATION SHALL BE THE SCOPE OF WORK THAT IS CONTEMPLATED BY THE APPLICANT AND THE CITY. THE APPLICANT FURTHER STIPULATES THAT SHOULD FURTHER ACTION BE TAKEN BY THE CITY FOR EXCEEDING THE SCOPE OF THE DESCRIPTION OF WORK, AS DESCRIBED HEREIN, AND IF THERE IS CONFLICTING INFORMATION BETWEEN THE DESCRIPTION OF WORK AND THE SUBMITTED PLANS, THE AFOREMENTIONED DESCRIPTION OF WORK SHALL BE CONTROLLING.

PROJECT INCLUDES: REPLACEMENT OF WINDOWS $\qquad$ RELOCATION OF A STRUCTURE $\qquad$ elevation of a structure X PROJECT INVOLVES A CONTRIBUTING STRUCTURE: YES X NO__ INVOLVES A HISTORIC STRUCTURE: YES ___ NO X PROJECT INVOLVES A STRUCTURE THAT IS INDIVIDUALLY LISTED ON THE NATIONAL REGISTER: YES $\qquad$ No $X$


## APPLICATIONS MUST BE SUBMITTED IN PERSON WITH HARD COPIES BY 3PM ON THE SCHEDULED DEADLINE'

 PLEASE SEND AN ELECTRONIC COPY OF ALL DOCUMENTS CITY_HARC@CITYOFKEYWEST-FL.GOV| ACCESSORY STRUCTURE(S): |  |
| :---: | :---: |
| - etached garager 10 | ange to pitched reot. 'leparir/ |
| replace Hardie siding |  |
|  |  |
| PAVERS: | FENCES: N/Vt |
|  | PAINTING: Pain t ven Hardie sicling |
|  |  |
|  |  |
| SITE (INCLUDING GRADING, FILL, TREES, ETC): | POOLS (INCLUDING EQUIPMENT): $\sim$ Nt |
| ACCESSORY EQUIPMENT (GAS, A/C, VENTS, ETC): | OTHER: |
| U/A |  |
|  |  |



THIS APPLICATION MAY BE REVIEWED BY PLANNING DEPARTMENT STAFF.

## HARC Certificate of Appropriateness: Demolition Appendix



City of Key West
1300 WHITE STREET
KEY WEST, FLORIDA 33040

| MARC COA \# | INITIAL \& DATE |
| :--- | :--- |
| ZONING DISTRICT | BLDG PERMIT \# |

ADDRESS OF PROPOSED PROJECT: PROPERTY OWNER'S NAME:

APPLICANT NAME:


I hereby certify I am the owner of record and that the work shall conform to all applicable laws of this jurisdiction. By receiving a Certificate of Appropriateness, I realize that this project will require a Building Permit approval PRIOR to proceeding with the work outlined above and that a final inspection is required under this application. I also understand that any changes to an approved Certificate of Appropriateness must be submitted for review


## CRITERIA FOR DEMOLITION OF CONTRIBUTING OR HISTORIC STRUCTURES:

Before any Certificate of Appropriateness may be issued for a demolition request, the Historic Architectural Review Commission must find that the following requirements are met (please review and comment on each criterion that applies);
(1) If the subject of the application is a contributing or historic building or structure, then it should not be demolished unless its condition is irrevocably compromised by extreme deterioration or it does not meet any of the following criteria:
(a) The existing condition of the building or structure is irrevocably compromised by extreme deterioration.
$\square$
(2) Or explain how the building or structure meets the criteria below:
(a) Embodies no distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction of aesthetic or historic significance in the city and is not a significant and distinguishable building entity whose components may lack individual distinction.

Nothing in this application is intended to alter the authority of the Building Official to condemn for demolition dangerous buildings, as provided in Section 102-218 of the Land Development Regulations and Chapter 14 of the Code of Ordinances.

|  |
| :--- |
| (b) Is not specifically associated with events that have made a significant contribution to local, state, or national history. |
|  |
| (c) Has no significant character, interest, or value as part fo the development, heritage, or cultural characteristics of the city, |
| state or nation, and is not associated with the life of a person significant in the past. |
| (h) Does not have a unique location or singular physical characteristic which represents an established and familiar visual |
| feature of its neighborhood or of the city, and does not exemplify the best remaining architectural type in a neighborhood. | | (d) Is not the site of a historic event with significant effect upon society. |
| :--- | | (g) If a part of or related to a square, park, or other distinctive area, nevertheless should not be developed or preserved |
| :--- |
| according to a plan based on the area's historic, cultural, natural, or architectural motif. |

Page 2 of 3

Nothing in this application is intended to alter the authority of the Building Official to condemn for demolition dangerous buildings, as provided in Section 102-218 of the Land Development Regulations and Chapter 14 of the Code of Ordinances.


## CRITERIA FOR DEMOLITION OF NON-CONTRIBUTING OR NON-HISTORIC STRUCTURES:

The following criteria will also be reviewed by the Historic Architectural Review Commission for proposed demolitions. The Commission shall not issue a Certificate of Appropriateness that would result in the following conditions (please review and comment on each criterion that applies);
(1) Removing buildings or structures that are important in defining the overall historic character of a district or neighborhood so that the

(2) Removing historic buildings or structures and thus destroying the historic relationship between buildings or structures and open space.

|  |
| :--- |
|  |
| (3) Removing an historic building or structure in a complex; or removing a building facade; or removing a significant later addition that is |
| important in defining the historic character of a site or the surrounding district or neighborhood. |
|  |
|  |
| (4) Removing buildings or structures that would otherwise qualify as contributing. |




Historic photo from 1965 showing the main structure at 905 Emma Street. No historic photos of the accessory structure were located.


Photo of the west elevation of the accessory structure at 905 Emma Street. Taken from Emma Street.


Photo of the south elevation of the accessory structure at 905 Emma Street. Showing existing roof overhangs to be removed.


Photo of the east elevation of the accessory structure at 905 Emma Street.

Boundary Survey Map of part of Tract 3 Island of Key West


LEGEND

```
Found 2"Iron Pipe (Fence Post)
Set 3/4" Iron Pipe w/coo (6298)
Found 1/2* Iron Rod (5234)
Found Noil \& Disc (PTS)
Set Nail \& Disc (6298)
Measured
Record
Measured \& Record
Concrete Block Structure
Right of Way
Chain Link Fence
Centerline
Wood Utility Pole
Concrete Utility Pole
Overhead Utility Lines
```







The Historic Architectural Review Commission will hold a public meeting at 5:00 p.m., May 25, 2021 at City Hall, 1300 White Street, Key West, Florida. In order to view the live feed of the meeting, you can tune in to Comcast channel 77, AT\&T Uverse channel 99, or type this link into your browser: http://keywestcity.granicus.com/MediaPlayer If you wish to participate virtually, please contact HARC staff at 305-809-3973. The purpose of the hearing will be to consider a request for:

## CHANGE IN ROOF FORM FROM FLAT TO GABLE ON EXISTING ACCESSORY STRUCTURE. DEMOLITION OF ROOF OVERHANGS.

## \#905 EMMA STREET

## Applicant -Titan Construction Application \#H2021-0023

If you wish to see the application or have any questions, you may visit the Planning Department during regular office hours at 1300 White Street, call 305-809-3973 or visit our website at www.cityofkeywest-fl.gov.

## A qPublic.net ${ }^{\text {"' }}$ Monroe County, FL

## Disclaimer

The Monroe County Property Appraiser's office maintains data on property within the County solely for the purpose of fulfilling its responsibility to secure a just valuation for ad valorem tax purposes of all property with in the County. The Monroe County Property Appraiser's office cannot guarantee its accuracy for any other purpose. Likewise, data provided regarding one tax year may not be applicable in prior or subsequent years. By requesting such data, you hereby understand and agree that the data is intended for ad valorem tax purposes

By continuing into this site you assert that you have read and agree to the above statement.

| Summary |  |
| :---: | :---: |
| Parcel ID | 00015090000000 |
| Account\# | 1015431 |
| Property ID | 1015431 |
| Millage Group | 11 kW |
| Location | 905 EMMA St, KEY WEST |
| Address |  |
| Legal | KW PT LOT 7 SQR 4 TR 3 UU-179 OR180-566/68 OR261-287/89 OR818-2031 OR934-1070/71 OR985-1618 OR985 |
| Description | 1619OR985-1620 OR988-1334 OR1030-1106 OR1033-2279 OR1401-280/82 OR1404-1515/16 OR1407-2026 OR1454-1179/80 OR1698-2187/89 OR1899-208/10 OR2713-2116/19 OR2767-917/21 OR2772-437/39 OR28311029/30 OR2838-2007 OR2917-1928/31 <br> (Note: Not to be used on legal documents.) |
| Neighborhood | 6021 |
| Property | MULTI FAMILY LESS THAN 10 UNITS (0800) |
| Class |  |
| Subdivision |  |
| $\mathrm{Sec} / \mathrm{Wwp} / \mathrm{Rng}$ | 06/68/25 |
| Affordable | No |
| Housing |  |



Owner


| Buildings |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Building ID | 1097 |  |  |  | Exterior Walls | ABOVEAVERAGE WOOD |
| Style | 2 STORY ELEV FOUNDATION |  |  |  | Year Built | 1939 |
|  | S.F.R.-R1/R1 |  |  |  | Effective YearBuilt | 2013 |
| Building Type GrossSqFt | 1920 |  |  |  | Foundation | CONC BLOCK |
| Finished Sa Ft | 1540 |  |  |  | Roof Type | GABLE/HIP |
| Stories | 2 Floor |  |  |  | Roof Coverage | METAL |
| Condition | AVERAGE |  |  |  | Flooring Type | CONC S/B GRND |
| Perimeter | 294 |  |  |  | Heating Type | FCD/AIR DUCTED with 0\% |
| Functional Obs | 5 |  |  |  | Bedrooms | 4 |
| Economic Obs | 0 |  |  |  | Full Bathrooms | 1 |
| Depreciation\% | \% |  |  |  | Half Bathrooms | 0 |
| Interior Walls | WALL BD/WD WAL |  |  |  | Grade | 550 |
|  |  |  |  |  | Number of Fire PI | 0 |
| Code De | Description | Sketch Area | Finished Area | Perimeter |  |  |
| FLA FL | floorlivarea | 1,540 | 1,540 | 294 |  |  |
| OPU OP | OPPRUNFINLL | 69 | 0 | 64 |  |  |
| OPF OP | OPPRCH FINLL | 119 | 0 | 48 |  |  |
| OUF OP | OPPRCH FINUL | 192 | 0 | 56 |  |  |
| TOTAL |  | 1,920 | 1,540 | 462 |  |  |
| Building ID |  |  |  |  | Exterior Walls | C.B.S. |
| Style | ${ }_{\text {GROUND LEVE }}$ |  |  |  | Year Built | 1991 |
| Building Type | S.F.R.-R1/R1 |  |  |  | EffectiveYearBuilt | 2013 |
|  | 463 |  |  |  | Foundation | CONCRFTR |
| Finished Sq Ft | 442 |  |  |  | Roof Type | FLATOR SHED |
| Stories | 1 Floor |  |  |  | Roof Coverage | TAR\& GRAVEL |
| Condition | AVERAGE |  |  |  | Flooring Type | CONC S/B GRND |
| Perimeter | 86 |  |  |  | HeatingType | NONE with 0\% NONE |
| Functional Obs | 50 |  |  |  | Bedrooms | 1 |
| Economic Obs | 0 |  |  |  | Full Bathrooms | 1 |
| Depreciation\% | \% 6 |  |  |  | Half Bathrooms | 0 |
| Interior Walls | DRYWALL |  |  |  | Grade | 500 |
|  |  |  |  |  | Number of Fire PI | 0 |
| Code De | Description | Sketch Area | Finished Area | Perimeter |  |  |


| FLA | FLOORLIVAREA | 442 | 442 | 86 |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| SEF | UTILFINBLK | 21 | 0 | 20 |
| TOTAL |  | 463 | 442 | 106 |


| Yard Items |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Description |  | Year Built | Roll Year |  | Quantity | Units | Grade |
| Fences |  | 1979 | 1980 |  | 1 | 384 SF | 2 |
| fences |  | 1996 | 1997 |  | 1 | 804 SF | 2 |
| Fences |  | 2016 | 2017 |  | 1 | 200 SF | 2 |
| brick patio |  | 2016 | 2017 |  | 1 | 718 SF | 3 |
| brick patio |  | 2019 | 2020 |  | 1 | 100 SF | 2 |
| RES POOL |  | 2019 | 2020 |  | 1 | 264 SF | 4 |
| Sales |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Sale Date | Sale Price | Instrument | Instrument Number | DeedBook | DeedPage | Sale Qualification | Vacant or Improved |
| 7/12/2018 | \$1,108,100 | WarrantyDeed | 2178716 | 2917 | 1928 | 30-Unqualified | Improved |
| 2/5/2017 | \$100 | WarrantyDeed | 2110018 | 2838 | 2007 | 11- Unqualified | Improved |
| 12/13/2016 | \$885,000 | WarrantyDeed | 2103914 | 2831 | 1029 | 02 - Qualified | Improved |
| 11/30/2015 | \$100 | WarrantyDeed |  | 2772 | 437 | 11- Unqualified | Improved |
| 9/28/2015 | \$530,300 | WarrantyDeed |  | 2767 | 917 | 12-Unqualified | Improved |
| 11/25/2014 | \$100 | Certificate of Title |  | 2713 | 2116 | 12-Unqualified | Improved |
| 5/29/2003 | \$560,000 | WarrantyDeed |  | 1899 | 0206 | Q-Qualified | Improved |
| 5/21/2001 | \$137.500 | Quit Claim Deed |  | 1698 | 2187 | P-Unqualified | Improved |
| 4/1/1997 | \$85,000 | WarrantyDeed |  | 1454 | 1179 | O-Unqualified | Improved |
| 5/1/1996 | \$8,000 | WarrantyDeed |  | 1404 | 1515 | O-Unqualified | Vacant |
| 4/1/1996 | \$150,000 | Warranty Deed |  | 1401 | 0280 | Q-Qualified | Improved |

Permits

Notes $\boldsymbol{*}$

| (ype |  |  |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| $18-0762$ | $4 / 1 / 2019$ | $9 / 20 / 2019$ | $\$ 35,000$ | Residential |
| $18-0783$ | $41 / 2019$ | $9 / 18 / 2019$ | $\$ 10,000$ | Residential |


| $18-0783$ | $4 / 1 / 2019$ | $9 / 18 / 2019$ | $\$ 10,000$ | Residential |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| $19-0353$ | $4 / 1 / 2019$ | $9 / 18 / 2019$ | $\$ 800$ | Residential |


| $18-1888$ | $5 / 3 / 2018$ | $5 / 29 / 2018$ | $\$ 12,500$ | Residential |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| $16-3523$ | $9 / 15 / 2016$ | $11 / 20 / 2016$ | $\$ 0,00$ | Reside |



| 16-1888 | 5/13/2016 | 11/29/2016 | \$2,500 | Residential | REMOVEFRONT DOOR ON 905 AND REPLACE WIHT 6 OVER 6 PANEL DOOR PAINT WHITE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 16-1244 | 3/31/2016 | 11/29/2016 | \$1,800 | Residential | R/R 35sf NOVELTY SIDING AND PAINT TO MATCH. R/R 65sf OF LAP SIDING AND PAINT TO MATCH |
| 16-792 | 2729/2016 |  |  |  |  |

16-792 $2 / 29 / 2016 \quad 11 / 29 / 2016 \quad \$ 1,800$ Residential WIRING/INSTALL OF KITCHEN GFI'SGARBAGE DISPOSAL RANGE AND FRIDGE AC COM PRESSORS/HANDLERS



View Tax Info
View Taxes for this Parcel

[^0]qPublic.net - Monroe County, FL - Report: 00015090-000000




2020 Notices Only
No data available for the following modules: Commercial Euildings, Motile Home Buildings: Exemptions.
The Monroe County Property Appraiser's office maintains data on property within the County solely for the purpose of fulfiling its responsibility to secure a just valuation for ad valorem tax purposes of all property within the County. The Monroe County Property Appraiser's office cannot guarantee its accuracy for any other purpose. Likewise, data provided regarding one tax year may not be applicable in prior or subsequent years. By requesting such data, you hereby understand and agree Iser Privacy Policy

Last Data Upload: 5/18/2021,3:51:57 AM


[^0]:    Sketches (click to enlarge)

