



Historic Architectural Review Commission Staff Report for Item 14

To: Chairman Bryan Green and Historic Architectural Review Commission Members

From: Kathleen McDonald, MHP
Historic Preservation Planner II

Meeting Date: August 24, 2021

Applicant: Raymond and LeeAnn Grundhoefer

Address: #1009 South Street

Description of Work:

Demolition of existing decking and gazebo structure.

Site Facts:

The site under review is located on the Northeast corner of South and Grinnell Streets. According to our survey, the structure on site is historic circa 1933, but is considered non-contributing. The 1948 and 1962 Sanborn maps show that the house originally had a U-shaped porch. The historic 1965 photo indicates that the U-shaped porch was enclosed sometime between 1962 and 1965. There is currently a non-historic gazebo structure and a wood deck at the Southwest corner of the property.

Ordinances Cited on Review:

- Section 102-217 (3), demolition for non-historic or non-contributing structures of the Land Development Regulations.
- Section 102-218 (b), Criteria for demolitions.

Staff Analysis:

The Certificate of Appropriateness under review proposes the demolition of an existing deck and non-historic gazebo structure at the Southwest corner of the property at 1009 South Street. The demolition would also include an existing porch at the rear of the house. Construction of an L-shaped front porch, a new pool, and a new deck are proposed as part of this application.

It is staff's opinion that the request for the demolition of the existing decking and non-historic gazebo and porch structures shall be based on the demolition criteria of Chapter 102 Section 218(b) of the LDR's. The criteria state the following;

b) *The historic architectural review commission shall not issue a certificate of appropriateness that would result in:*

- (1) *Removing buildings or structures that are important in defining the overall historic character of a district or neighborhood so that the character is diminished;*

It is staff's opinion that the removal of the existing structures will not have a negative effect on the character of the surrounding neighborhood.

- (2) *Removing historic buildings or structures and thus destroying the historic relationship between buildings or structures and open space;*

The structures under review for demolition are not historic.

- (3) *Removing an historic building or structure in a complex; or removing a building façade; or removing a significant later addition that is important in defining the historic character of a site or the surrounding district or neighborhood;*

The structures under review are not significant later additions, and they have not acquired historic significance that is important to the site or surrounding district.

- (4) *Removing buildings or structures that would otherwise qualify as contributing, as set forth in section 102-62(3).*

It is staff's opinion that the structures in question will not qualify as contributing elements to the site or to the historic district in the near future.

It is staff's opinion that the Commission can review the request for demolition. If approved, this will be the only required reading for demolition.